KU LEUVEN

FACULTY OF PSYCHOLOGY AND

EDUCATIONAL SCIENCES

**His master’s voice**

A history of the teacher’s voice, 1880-1940

Master’s thesis submitted for the degree of Master of Science in Educational Studies by

**Luna Lemoine**

Supervisor: Pieter Verstraete

2023

KU LEUVEN

FACULTY OF PSYCHOLOGY AND

EDUCATIONAL SCIENCES

**His master’s voice**

A history of the teacher’s voice, 1880-1940

Master’s thesis submitted for the degree of Master of Science in Educational Studies by

**Luna Lemoine**

Supervisor: Pieter Verstraete

2023

# Summary

The voice is a crucial tool that teachers use on a daily basis to carry out their pedagogical practices. Its importance is highlighted by the significant amount of medical and quantitative research that has been done on the voice in terms of preserving it and of limiting the negative impact it can have on students’ achievements. The few qualitative research on sounds – which often include voice – in fields such as history of education have already brought important nuances on the topic by showing that what could and should be heard at school (e.g. the teacher’s speech) can change throughout time. Yet, little qualitative research has investigated the voice, despite the fact that it has a potential power to change the meaning of a sentence by, for example, varying its tone. Authors of existing qualitative research hence plead for further research on it.

Based on this, the thesis will further build on a previous master thesis and investigate the teacher’s voice in an attempt to open the doors of the field of history of education on the teacher’s voice. To do so, their voice will be investigated under the historiographical framework of New Culture of History of Education. By inscribing the research in this framework, the thesis supposes that the teacher’s voice can be considered as a powerful tool that needs to be understood more thoroughly. The thesis is based on Belgian pedagogical journals published in French between 1880 and 1940. Firstly, the presentation of the teacher’s voice will be investigated in the selected archives. Secondly, the thesis will also compare the presentations of voice between Catholic and liberal pedagogical journals, as the investigated period is partly characterized by the School War which opposed the two camps in educational policy. Moreover, based on the presentations of the voice in the archive, it will be investigated whether a problematization of it can be found.

Due to the lack of available Catholic pedagogical journals, pedagogical manuals were added, and the investigated period was reduced to 1880 to 1914. Based on these selected archives, the thesis confirms three previous findings on the teacher’s voice presentation: the need to vary the tone, the role of the teacher’s voice in its authority and the teacher’s speech as a model for students. Unique findings were the presentation of different tones for specific course subjects and, related to this, the fact that the teacher’s voice was often described in relation to his soul. No difference between Catholic and liberal journals could be found. Lastly, due to the short period investigated, discussion on the problematization of the teacher’s voice could not be conducted. The discussion hence pleads for further longitudinal studies on the teacher’s voice to investigate potential problematization of it, as well as more research on the link between voice and the teacher’s authority.

# Acknowledgements

I would like to start by expressing my deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Pieter Verstraete, for the rigorous guidance he has provided me throughout the process of writing my thesis. It is through his constructive criticisms that I was able to conduct and write a scientific research I am proud of, and thanks to those exchanges I was also able to develop my confidence as a graduating student in terms of scientific and analytical skills.

I am also thankful for Ms. Maria Leon, from the Finance Team and Research Units’ Administrative Office of the Faculty of Psychology and Educational Studies at KU Leuven. She has kindly taken some time to introduce me to the *Historische Collectie Psychologie en Pedagogisch Wetenschappen*. Without that, I would not have had access to the rich data in the archives that the university library kept. I would also like to extend my sincere thanks to Professor Pieter Verstraete, Professor Sarah Van Ruyskensvelde, Professor Lourens Van Haaften (University of Groningen) and Professor Johannes Westberg (University of Groningen) for the insightful seminars they have given to students with thesis in the field of history of education. The knowledge they have generously shared during those sessions have hugely helped me in the process of writing a thesis in a field I was new to.

Special thanks also go to my cohort members with whom exchanging ideas and working progress has been crucial in terms of moral support as well as intellectual stimulation. I would also like to mention my family for the time spent proof-reading and suggesting edits, as well as for the emotional support they provided me by showing interest in the topic of my thesis. The final thanks are dedicated to my grandparents: to my grandmother, who opens up the introduction of my thesis with her precious advice; and my grandfather who has spent his whole career as a teacher in the primary education and who has spent time explaining to me the changes that the educational system had gone through to plunge me into the topic of this thesis.

# Clarification of the student’s approach and contribution to the thesis

The present thesis has been written by myself, Luna Lemoine, in collaboration with my supervisor Professor Pieter Verstraete. Professor Verstraete has proposed this thesis topic, which comprised a broad idea on the scope of the research (i.e. how the teacher’s voice was presented and whether it was problematized), on the geographical area and on the time frame. These were based on the thesis of Nick Calcoen, of which this present thesis is a continuation and which has provided important exploratory findings in terms of overall presentation of the teacher’s voice in Dutch-written pedagogical periodicals.

Professor Verstraete has guided me throughout the whole process of the completion of this thesis, and his guidance was crucial for the completion of it. He has suggested to me some relevant literature, explained to me several important concepts and has discussed with me the directions that my conclusion could take. Moreover, the selection of the secondary sources could not have been possible if Professor Verstraete had not advised me to contact Ms. Maria Leon, as she had provided me with the form to request access to the archives of the faculty library at the faculty of psychology and educational studies in KU Leuven. Professor Verstraete has also advised me to add manuals to have a more solid basis of analysis due to the scarcity of the primary sources that corresponded to the criteria.

The thesis of Nick Calcoen has provided me information regarding existing content on the research topic, methodology and format of thesis. Those information were used to familiarize myself with the process and presentation of historical research, which I had never conducted before. In terms of information regarding historical research, the seminars organized by Professor Pieter Verstraete, Professor Sarah Van Ruyskensvelde, Professor Lourens Van Haaften (University of Groningen) and Professor Johannes Westberg (University of Groningen) have also significantly contributed to the writing of this thesis. Through four online sessions organized throughout the whole academic year, the professors have developed how historical research should be conducted and presented.

Lastly, to mention my own contribution, I have first come up with further detailed research questions regarding educational beliefs. This was based on a research of secondary sources that was carried out by myself, followed by a selection and analysis of primary sources also conducted by me. It should also be noted that as this is a historical research, the reference style will not follow the APA-style but rather the Chicago style as approved by my supervisor. I have also decided to include a bibliography at the end as the Chicago style allows the inclusion of it if needed.

# Table of Content

[Summary i](#_Toc145405458)

[Acknowledgements ii](#_Toc145405459)

[Clarification of the student’s approach and contribution to the thesis iii](#_Toc145405460)

[Table of Content iv](#_Toc145405461)

[Introduction 1](#_Toc145405462)

[1. Investigating the voice 4](#_Toc145405463)

[1.1. Listening to sounds of the past 4](#_Toc145405464)

[1.2. Traces of sounds in education 5](#_Toc145405465)

[1.3. Importance of the voice 6](#_Toc145405466)

[1.3.1. The teacher’s voice : a fragile tool 7](#_Toc145405467)

[1.3.2. Voices in history 8](#_Toc145405468)

[1.3.3. The teacher’s voice: a pedagogical tool 11](#_Toc145405469)

[1.4. Framing the research question 13](#_Toc145405470)

[1.4.1. Power of the voice 13](#_Toc145405471)

[1.4.2. Time frame 15](#_Toc145405472)

[1.4.3. The archives 15](#_Toc145405473)

[2. Methodology 18](#_Toc145405474)

[2.1. Descriptions of journals 20](#_Toc145405475)

[2.1.1. Le Progrès 20](#_Toc145405476)

[2.1.2. Moniteur des instituteurs primaires 21](#_Toc145405477)

[2.1.3. L’Ecole belge 21](#_Toc145405478)

[2.1.4. L’école Catholique 22](#_Toc145405479)

[2.2. Description of manuals 23](#_Toc145405480)

[2.2.1. Traité théorique et pratique de méthodologie 23](#_Toc145405481)

[2.2.2. Résumé du cours de pédagogie par un ancien directeur d’école normale 23](#_Toc145405482)

[2.2.3. Quelques directions méthodologiques pour le personnel des écoles primaires et les maîtresses Frœbéliennes 24](#_Toc145405483)

[2.2.4.Cours complet de pédagogie et de méthodologie 24](#_Toc145405484)

[2.3. Time frame of journals 25](#_Toc145405485)

[3. Voice to teach 26](#_Toc145405486)

[3.1. Voice tone 26](#_Toc145405487)

[3.2. Course specific tone 28](#_Toc145405488)

[3.3. Voice intensity 29](#_Toc145405489)

[4. Voice and language 31](#_Toc145405490)

[4.1. His master’s authority 31](#_Toc145405491)

[4.1.1. Firmness and kindness 31](#_Toc145405492)

[4.1.2. Passion and practice 34](#_Toc145405493)

[4.1.3. Preparation 35](#_Toc145405494)

[4.2. Communication between souls 36](#_Toc145405495)

[4.2.1. Communication between souls 36](#_Toc145405496)

[4.2.2. The lively speech 37](#_Toc145405497)

[4.2.3. The essence of teaching 39](#_Toc145405498)

[4.2.4. A mere vehicle 40](#_Toc145405499)

[5. Discussion 42](#_Toc145405500)

[5.1. Conclusion 42](#_Toc145405501)

[5.2. Limitations and further suggestions 45](#_Toc145405502)

[6. Bibliography 48](#_Toc145405503)

[6.1. Bibliography primary sources 48](#_Toc145405504)

[L’Ecole belge 48](#_Toc145405505)

[L’école Catholique 48](#_Toc145405506)

[Moniteur des instituteurs primaires 49](#_Toc145405507)

[Le Progrès 49](#_Toc145405508)

[Manuals 50](#_Toc145405509)

[6.2. Bibliography secondary literature 51](#_Toc145405510)

# Introduction

“When you need children to listen to your instructions while they are noisy, try to silently move your lips as if you were talking, without using your voice”. This is a class-management tip I have recently received from my grandmother who has worked as a kindergarten teacher her whole career. She carried on by explaining to me how children would be deeply surprised by not hearing their teacher’s voice while she was moving her lips as if she was saying something. This would eventually lead her whole class to become silent and to fix their eyes on her.

I have chosen to start my thesis with this personal quote as the interest for the topic of the present thesis partly comes from my own experience. Having started a student job as a teacher at the beginning of my preparatory year, I have discovered the world of teaching, despite the few hours I have been working as a student. Being responsible for around six children per hour, I teach English in an afterschool English school for students mainly in the lower grades of primary school. The first few months had been extremely challenging as I had to learn how children around 6 years old were behaving. As I sometimes felt helpless in front of the children who would endlessly chat about their day to their friends or who would become sleepy during class, I had several conversations and training sessions with more experienced teachers within my school. Those had provided me with practical tips that I could use in class and that were not mentioned in the initial short teacher training I had at the beginning of the scholastic year.

Today, I still draw on most of them, and in my second year of teaching, I am now able to share those tips with novice teachers that have joined our team. Some of the most useful tips include changing the voice tone – speak with a robotic voice, with a high pitch or a low pitch voice – to catch students’ attention and keep them focused on what we are learning; making sudden changes in the voice such as shouting shortly and abruptly to break the cycle of misbehavior; or not raising my voice when the children get loud, but rather talking in a whispering voice and inviting students to copy me. This last tip is something I still struggle with, as I instinctively tend to raise my voice to go over the chit chat and noise in class. Nonetheless, I often realize how raising my voice is detrimental, not only for the class as the children do not understand that they are loud, but for my own voice. In that way, when it comes to singing with children after such solicitation of my vocal cords, I often feel how much I have forced on them as it becomes challenging to hit the right notes. Such partial loss of voice made me become aware of how my vocal chords were a crucial tool for my teaching, as when I couldn’t use my voice properly, the teaching experience would always be worse for me and for my students.

My experience does not seem to be that personal and limited to me as it seems that many of those who have already experienced a teaching position might actually recognize themselves in my story. Indeed, a brief research using the keyword ‘voice’ on websites of Belgian teacher associations or pedagogical journals suggests that teachers are increasingly worried about how to use their voice correctly. For example, *La Ligue* – a French-speaking organization that defends public and secular education – offered a workshop to get to know one’s voice in April 2023[[1]](#footnote-1). This workshop targeted professionals such as teachers and sport coaches, and it consisted of vocal exercises with the aim of gaining confidence in the use of one’s voice. According to the description of the workshop, this loss of confidence is common and is due to the fact that those professionals do not know how to “tame” their voice[[2]](#footnote-2). Hence, the workshop was an opportunity to learn that. A similar example can be found on the website of the Dutch-speaking pedagogical journal *Klasse*. The last article that talked about the voice was one that provided tips for teachers who experience vocal issues[[3]](#footnote-3). The article started by stating that six out of ten teachers experience issues related to their voice, and that practices such as moistening the voice by drinking regularly could help to avoid throat pain[[4]](#footnote-4). Many videos across the article show the vocal coach performing the tips.

The two examples cited above are part of numerous workshops and tutorials for teachers to follow in order to ‘preserve’ their voice or to learn how to use it ‘properly’ and ‘efficiently’. Such offers that are easily reachable online hint the importance and omnipresence of voice in teaching. Following this line of thinking, the teacher’s voice could be considered as a didactical tool that teachers use on a day-to-day basis. From an academic perspective, it could be enriching to understand the concerns that professionals in the pedagogical field have on those tools. This is even more the case as the historian of education Marc Depaepe and his colleagues have stated in their book on the history of pedagogical practices in Belgium that: “didactic principles are not neutral or passive. From within their relationship with the culture of school, they can also begin to lead a life of their own”[[5]](#footnote-5). By these sentences, the authors imply that the attention brought to and the intention of some didactic tools should be studied as they are complex. They can evolve throughout time and are often intertwined with broader contexts in which teachers and schools are.

When connected together, the importance of the teacher’s voice and the need to understand better such tools bring up several questions. One of such questions is: has the importance of the teacher’s voice always been addressed, and has this always been in terms of preserving it? Another way to formulate these questions can be: have teachers’ vocal practices been described in the past? If so, in what terms, and what do these descriptions tell us about the teachers or the educational system? The aim of this thesis is to explore those questions and to investigate how the teacher’s voice has been described in pedagogical journals in the past, as this could help to have a better understanding of the place that the voice has had in education.

# Investigating the voice

This first chapter will develop the existing literature to situate the present thesis in the broader academic context. The review of the literature will first summarize acoustic research, and it will continue by presenting historical research on the sounds. It will develop studies on the voice to illustrate how researching voice from a historical perspective could be needed, before finishing the chapter with the presentation of the research question that will be investigated throughout the thesis.

## 1.1. Listening to sounds of the past

In his music classes, the Canadian composer Murray Schafer comes to the conclusion that modern societies are filled up with sounds, which are mostly harmful for human beings[[6]](#footnote-6). To demonstrate this argument, he carried out an introductory exercise with his students, in which they had to listen silently to the surrounding sounds and describe them. Schafer then further invited his students to look into documents, whether written texts or visual arts, to find any descriptions of sounds. What he concluded from this exercise was that the more societies evolve towards post-industrial cultures, the more sounds come from tools and technology at the expense of sounds coming from nature or human beings[[7]](#footnote-7). His study focusing on sounds, which according to him are increasingly forgotten as background noise, has led many scholars to pay more attention to the audible information that can be gathered in different environments and in different time periods.

Perhaps one of the most famous of such research that investigates soundscape – a contraction of the words ‘sound’ and ‘landscape’ – is Corbin’s historical study of church bells. Based on written sources from the 19th century, Corbin describes the influence that the sound of church bells had on rural areas of France: the sound of the bells was deeply connected to the local and religious identity of the villagers, and this had led to power struggles between local and religious authorities notably[[8]](#footnote-8). As an example, Corbin depicts how secular authorities prohibited bells from ringing on certain holy days to secure their influence as governing power. Archives stipulate that despite this interdiction, bells could be heard in many villages. Although it seemed that church bells had brought inhabitants of the same rural area together, Corbin noticed how the role played by church bells, and hence their sound, became increasingly overtaken by more soundless materials such as letters to communicate to the assembly or clocks to show the time. Historical studies on soundscapes such as Corbin’s show that sounds are as important as other materials in examining our past. Research based on sounds is however still relatively scarce, despite the significant nuances it can add to our understanding of the world.

## 1.2. Traces of sounds in education

Just as historians in general, historians of education have also started to include audible information as objects of studies. However, this is a relatively recent current in the field because scholars have traditionally focused on how educational theories have emerged and evolved, as well as on the policies organizing the educational system[[9]](#footnote-9). The gradual interest for new subjects of studies is linked to the expanding consideration of source materials that are not written. After a tradition of working with written sources, researchers began to look for the presence or absence of materials in educational settings, which could be investigated by visual archives such as photographs[[10]](#footnote-10). In the field of history, this was coined by the term ‘visual turn’[[11]](#footnote-11). This led to a diversification of interests, as instead of focusing on the bigger picture, historians of education became increasingly interested in bringing to light what happened in more micro-settings such as classrooms[[12]](#footnote-12).

Following this movement, some scholars have naturally been intrigued in the function of audition in education from a historical perspective, as schools have always been characterized by a considerable presence of sound. The concern for sound in history might raise questions such as how to accurately retrieve sounds that existed before technologies that could record them. It is indeed difficult to retrieve the richness of a sound other than by actually listening to it and experiencing it, but Burke and Grosvenor name a few sources that can be used to reconstitute historical sounds in educational settings as precisely as possible[[13]](#footnote-13). Following them, written sources such as personal diaries often recount sounds that could be heard in educational settings, while pedagogical texts inform us on what audible practices were suggested or discredited. Visual sources can enlighten us on what objects in the classroom could have made sounds, such as school bells, whistles or radios. Photographs, and later movies can also represent school practices and everyday life at school. In that way, we can imagine from those archives the sound of the chairs that were pulled, the voices of students reading aloud or students singing together. Nonetheless, researching time periods before the 20th century limits the sources due to the absence of audio-visual recording technology. Sources used to study this period are therefore mostly material or written.

Along those lines, Landahl studied the shift in the soundscape of classrooms in Sweden from the beginning of the 19th century to the end of the century by making use of pedagogical manuals. Landahl noticed that the success of the Lancastrian system had declined in the middle of the century[[14]](#footnote-14). This system is also known as the monitorial educational model, and consisted of pupils reciting their lessons aloud in small groups while the teacher monitored the class. Instead of this educational practice, a teacher-led model emerged, and this had led to a drastic change in the sounds that could be heard in the classrooms. Indeed, the Swedish classrooms in the first half of the century were characterized by pupils' voices reciting their lessons, as well as by choral sounds of pupils closing their books at once or resting their hands on the table in unison. Sounds produced by the teachers were often stamping, clapping or bells ringing to give instructions about what pupils had to do. The teacher-led model inverted this, as students had to increasingly be quiet and as they had to listen to their teachers’ explanations. Students were now prohibited from thinking aloud, and when they wanted to say something, they had to raise their hands and wait silently for the teacher’s permission to talk. What could be heard was thus the teacher’s voice and occasionally students’ remarks.

The discovery of such drastic changes in educational soundscape was also pointed out by Hoegaerts who, relying on pedagogical writings of the 19th century, has observed that the notion of silence and sound at school was not inherent but rather socially coded and defined[[15]](#footnote-15). In that way, despite the overall appraisal of silence in classrooms towards the end of the 19th century, students were asked to raise their voice for particular practices such as the learning of poetry or the reading of words.

## 1.3. Importance of the voice

The previous sections have shown that, as its name evokes, the central object of study of soundscape research is what can be heard or not. Adding to this, one can notice that research situated at the intersection of soundscape studies and history of education often mention voices. This is because voice is a significant part of the sounds that we encounter inside educational settings. The voice is also considered as something that is breaking silence, hence voice is often mentioned to frame moments of silence. However, scholars have already raised concerns about the scarcity of research solely dedicated to voices[[16]](#footnote-16). Indeed, despite Schafer’s observation on the decrease of sounds originating from human beings, voice is still something that is omnipresent in our societies as it is a central part of what human beings use to communicate[[17]](#footnote-17). Following those lines, the next subsections will develop what is already known about voice in diverging fields.

### 1.3.1. The teacher’s voice : a fragile tool

Despite its omnipresence and its essential impact on our daily communication, voice is a material that is very difficult to grasp: as Le Breton describes it, the voice is like water that leaks between the fingers when we try to catch it[[18]](#footnote-18). Medical instruments that allow to visualize the vocal organs have nonetheless facilitated certain research on such an immaterial object of study. Medical branches dedicated to vocal health issues are surely the domains that study voice the most thanks to those instruments. Naturally, patients of such disciplines are essentially professionals for whom voice is a tool used daily in their careers such as singers, religious preachers or teachers, as those are more at risk to develop voice complications than the general population[[19]](#footnote-19). Amongst those professionals, teachers are more prone to expose their voices to detrimental environments: their working settings are characterized most of the time by excessive levels of noise and their busy days can cause stress and lead tounhealthy lifestyles, which tends to aggravate vocal conditions[[20]](#footnote-20). Adding to this, they do not benefit from enough training that could help them to discern good and bad practices for their vocal organs[[21]](#footnote-21). This explains why most of the medical branches dedicated to voice focuses on therapies for teachers, as they are considered as a fragile population.

Building up on the fragility of teachers’ voices, recent scientific literature has tried to quantify and prove how teachers’ voices could impact children’s learning experience. Although bold conclusions cannot be drawn because of the difficulty in controlling surrounding noises or standardizing the voice impairment levels, experimental research has shown that the clearer students can hear their teachers, the less cognitive attention they have to spend in deciphering instructions or explanations[[22]](#footnote-22). This is translated into better academic performances as children can spend more energy to actually focus on their tasks, and they can generally complete those faster and more accurately[[23]](#footnote-23). This is especially true in lower elementary school grades, when children are not yet used to listening to instructions in noisy environments. Research has proven that in general, children in primary education have more difficulties in discerning words when their teachers have a dysphonic voice, and this could be even more aggravated when the surrounding noise level is significant[[24]](#footnote-24). To limit the negative consequences of such vicious circles of teachers forcing their voice to go over noises, medical studies mentioned above are crucial.

Nonetheless, on top of those medical treatments that could heal or prevent teachers’ voice issues, there also exists a significant body of research on non-medical solutions to support the healthy functioning of teachers’ vocal organs. One example is to rely on technology: because voice hoarseness in teachers is mainly caused by excessive surrounding noises, some projects have tried to compensate for this by putting speakers in the classrooms and providing teachers with a microphone. The Improving Classroom Acoustics project led in Florida from 1993 to 1995 has for instance provided empirical evidence that implementing such technology in class helps teachers to feel less tired because they do not need to put strain on their voice anymore[[25]](#footnote-25). Another example is to provide teachers with training focused on voice use, or more simply to publish recommendations that they can easily follow on a day-to-day basis to know their voice better and hence to limit dysphonia. The recommendation for preschool teachers published by the Ministry of Education in France, which explains how to use and to take care of one’s voice, is one of those pieces of advice to follow. Exercises to train the voice are presented, such as simply saying “hello” and seeing whether the teacher feels itching in the throat, in which case the teacher will have to try different pitch and intensity until they find one that does not put stress on their vocal cords[[26]](#footnote-26). Other exercises include finding the right posture, relaxing jaws and muscles surrounding the mouth, or breathing exercises. On top of this, the five pages document includes hygiene recommendations such as not screaming, not smoking, avoiding air conditioning, relaxing and lastly not forcing on the voice when the teacher starts to feel throat inflammation.

### 1.3.2. Voices in history

As it can be understood so far, what we know about voice is largely based on experimental research: many of the research around voice are quantitative ones that measure the quality or the impact of certain voices, with a specific focus on causalities and solutions. In other words, voice today is often touched upon from a medical perspective with suggestions on how to preserve the teacher’s voice and how to avoid or treat issues related to it. Based on this observation, it can be argued that until recently, very little attention has been paid to qualitative aspects of the voice. Some scholars have started to explore the voice with such scopes, but to understand this gap in academic research, one must first understand what is meant by ‘voice’ in fields such as educational history.

Despite its rather long tradition of the use of the word ‘voice’, the lack of qualitative observations of it is also present in historical fields of research. This is because similarly to many fields in the humanities, the word ‘voice’ has two definitions in historical studies: a literal and a metaphorical one. The literal voice is what is produced by vocal cords. It can be described in terms of «pitch, loudness and timber»[[27]](#footnote-27). The metaphorical definition is broader than this. It relates to narratives, and from a historical perspective, to the narration of those whose lives were forgotten[[28]](#footnote-28). The voice – or in other words the story – of those individuals is not only forgotten because they do not live anymore, but also because their life is rarely explicitly represented in the archives. One of the main tasks of historians is thus to look deeper for traces of those people in order to bring them to light[[29]](#footnote-29). This implies that historians’ voices also play a role in the analysis, although it is crucial to be as close to the truth as possible and hence to follow academic methods such as intertwining multiple sources of information[[30]](#footnote-30).

The two definitions do not mean that in research, they should be mutually exclusive. The few research around the literal voice conducted by historians of education show that the diverging definitions of ‘voice’ can interweave[[31]](#footnote-31). In that way, research has shown that how children used their voice through their speech was already a matter of concern amongst pedagogues in the early 20th century[[32]](#footnote-32). Those studies in history of education have shown that while silence was recommended as a cure for those who stuttered, those who did not speak were encouraged and taught to express themselves by using their voice[[33]](#footnote-33). This can be read in the letters and documents written by the French doctor Itard, who tried unsuccessfully to teach speech and manners to the ‘Wild Boy of Aveyron’[[34]](#footnote-34). The French educator Séguin has also left his pedagogical beliefs that inspired him to establish an educational center for ‘idiots’ who had speech disorders[[35]](#footnote-35). Based on the descriptions made by historians looking into speech impediments, it could be argued that even if children could pronounce words or sometimes even sentences, they had to be corrected as soon as those were spoken in a way that impeded the comprehension.

Although the investigations mentioned above are more focused on the speech than on the literal voice, they exemplify how voice is crucial for us to live in a society. Indeed, it should not be considered as a mere organic tool for human beings to pronounce words, as human beings try to make sense of the voice they hear regardless of the meaning of the words that are spoken[[36]](#footnote-36). A qualitative focus seems crucial since the same sentences containing exactly the same words and the same punctuations can be said in different ways by changing one’s tone of voice. Those sentences can then have completely different meanings when spoken, despite being identical on paper. Voice can thus convey meanings that cannot be seen visually and that can only be perceived in one’s mind through voice. This explains why most of us will speculate on the personality or appearance of a person solely on its voice, and this even if the person cannot be seen: a low voice can signal an authoritative character, a louder volume will suggest that the speaker feels confident, and a higher pitch will often evoke femininity[[37]](#footnote-37).

Those different connotations we give to voice are most of the time shaped by social norms that each culture has built. The anthropological work of Le Breton – which he himself describes as merely explorative – deals with those norms and meanings we give to different voices and vocal practices. Le Breton touches upon the fact that the norms around vocal practices are mostly tacit, but they become more apparent when certain ways to speak become problematized and sometimes medicalized[[38]](#footnote-38). Along those lines, Hoegaerts has found that while there were moments where silence was praised, remaining silent was considered to evidence the absence of opinion and hence dumbness in other contexts[[39]](#footnote-39). Knowing when to talk was therefore a sign of intelligence. Taking this further, because voice is so close to one’s personality, speech that does not correspond to social norms can even be translated into flawed moral characteristics[[40]](#footnote-40). This is reflected in the fact that the voice of children such as the Wild Boy or deaf-mutes were often compared to the voice of animals, and fictional characters who cannot speak well were qualified as uncivilized in opposition to well-educated characters who talked according to the social conventions that everyone should have aimed for[[41]](#footnote-41). Research of critical historians of disability who use a Foucauldian approach further builds on these remarks by demonstrating that voice is in fact strongly linked to civility[[42]](#footnote-42). Those scholars noticed an exponential increase in speech therapies in the 19th century and suggested that this was because speech needed to become more productive as capitalism was rising[[43]](#footnote-43). People were increasingly diagnosed and treated medically in order to ensure that a maximum of the population becomes productive[[44]](#footnote-44). Voice can thus define personality based on norms that are not inherent to it, such as being productive or well-educated. By extension, voice tones and pitch can also be at the origin of social roles and relationship dynamics. As an example of the latter, research participants who belong to minority groups often become reluctant to cooperate or participate in research out of fear, because they perceive an authoritative or paternalistic tone in the voice of the researchers who are part of a dominant social group[[45]](#footnote-45). These examples show once again that qualitative research is crucial to uncover such effects that the voice could have.

### 1.3.3. The teacher’s voice: a pedagogical tool

The examples mentioned in the previous subsection hints that a qualitative understanding of the voice is interesting to have in the educational field. The “wild children” show the central role of voice: those children had little occasions to listen to other human beings’ voices, and this is likely to be one of the reasons why they could not use theirs according to social norms. More generally, this could mean that to be able to express oneself amongst others, there is a need to interact with others and to learn from the exchange. Following these lines, the voice of teachers becomes crucial not only as a tool to transmit knowledge, but also in itself, for children to learn how to use their own voice. Within the historical research, this argument also seems to prevail. Indeed, the few historical research on the teacher’s voice show that its importance in educating children is not something new, and it seems that it has been considered as a key element to teaching for centuries. As an example, Séguin and Montessori have both qualified the teacher’s voice as a central tool to gear students’ attention[[46]](#footnote-46). More specific advice can be found in Swedish pedagogical journals, where the shift in the middle of the 19th century from the monitorial to the teacher-led system had drastically forced teachers to learn how to speak to their students[[47]](#footnote-47). Landahl shows how those pedagogical manuals from the 19th century took into account the teacher’s voice to assess the quality of their work, as well as how voices started to be described by various adjectives such as vivid, authoritative, not authoritarian, or fluent[[48]](#footnote-48). In Belgium, teachers were sometimes mocked due to the huge emphasis on their oratory skills during their training[[49]](#footnote-49). This meant that teachers would talk a lot to transfer their knowledge, but soon they were encouraged to master the art of asking questions and prompting answers from pupils[[50]](#footnote-50).

Recent literature has started to investigate more deeply how voice can shape the dynamics between teachers and students. Koch realized that if teachers took a paternalistic tone, children would take on more passive attitudes in which they would obey instructions[[51]](#footnote-51). On the contrary, if teachers took a tone that placed them as mentors, children were more likely to see their teachers as a partner to learn. Consequently, children would take an active part in their learning. Based on this, Koch believes that the role students take unconsciously based on the tone they perceive in their teacher’s voice can be linked to the role they will play in democracy when becoming adult citizens[[52]](#footnote-52). Koch’s study is based on the teacher’s spontaneous use of voice, which hints that in fact, many teachers naturally play with different voices to teach. In that way, official texts such as the recommendation from the French Ministry of education explicitly encourages teachers to record their voice to critically assess its fluidity, intonation, intelligibility, pronunciation and tone[[53]](#footnote-53). Several adjectives that can help them to qualify their teaching voice are presented: « singing, monotone (…) artificial, spontaneous, boring (…) clear, confused, constant, fluctuant, (…) guttural or dental »[[54]](#footnote-54). These kinds of guidelines are issued for teachers to get acquainted with their own voice and to make a conscious use of it as a pedagogical tool.

Based on interviews conducted while watching video-recordings of teachers in action, Moustapha-Sabeur and Aguilar argued similarly. They have concluded that most of the teachers interviewed had developed three main different uses of voice to work as efficiently as possible[[55]](#footnote-55). Teachers had one voice to interact with students, one to facilitate the learning of their students, and one to manage their classrooms. Those techniques were differentiated by changing the voice tone, the speed at which they spoke, or the volume and the pitch of their voice. The voice to interact with students was often qualified as friendly but firm by teachers themselves: teachers wanted to stay approachable and liked by their students, but at the same time they were aware that they should keep their role as teachers by performing the right amount of authority. The voice to facilitate learning was often slower, clearer, and a variation of tones of voice are used to insist on some words or syllables. This was especially the case for foreign language teachers who often cut new or tricky words into shorter syllables. They also tended to put more emotions in their voice to make some words or sentences more understandable. Lastly, the voice which was used to manage the classroom was the voice that varied the most. To keep their students focused, teachers changed the volume and intensity of their voice. As a teacher expressed it, voices should not be monotonous because that would make students day-dream. The tone could also become more firm, and the volume could increase to centralize the attention to the teacher after an activity. As teachers were well aware that voice was part of didactical tools, and as they were also aware that voice transmitted emotions, some teachers tended to control the emotional inflections of their voice, fearing that their emotional state might disturb the learning process of their students. Once again, the strong link between teachers and their voice was described by Moustapha-Sabeur and Aguilar as following:

« The voice materializes itself in function of principles and of an experience that evolves depending on the teacher’s path. Voice and teacher’s identity are linked : it is by working on one’s voice – by thinking about it – that the teacher understands, constructs and modifies its way to be a teacher. »[[56]](#footnote-56)

## 1.4. Framing the research question

The previous sections have shown that the teacher’s voice has been studied rather extensively through quantitative methods, often with the aim of helping teachers to preserve their voice. On the other hand, the sections have pointed out that their voice was relatively less studied in the humanities, from a qualitative perspective. Nonetheless, the few studies that have recently been conducted indicate how human beings attribute a significant range of qualitative characteristics to one’s voice. By this, they hint the importance of investigating it through qualitative methods. This is especially the case for the teacher’s voice, as the amount and purpose of the quantitative studies illustrate the crucial role of the teacher’s voice in everyday pedagogy. Based on these observations, the present thesis will explore how teachers were encouraged and instructed to use their voice in class. This section will outline the precise questions that will be addressed by this thesis.

### 1.4.1. Power of the voice

Before stating and justifying the research question, it should be specified that the present thesis is situated within the historiographical approach of New Cultural History of Education. To understand what this scope implies for the research, this subsection will explain what is meant by this approach and why this particular framework was chosen.

Fendler has explained that one of the characteristics of New Cultural History in general is its critical scope[[57]](#footnote-57). The aim of many studies under this framework is to question and challenge notions of objectivity and normativity in order to avoid a one-sided historiography[[58]](#footnote-58). Such concerns were supported by a broadening of the types of sources and subjects investigated[[59]](#footnote-59). In that way, source material that were not official texts were also included, such as personal diaries but also material or visual archives (e.g. school furniture, photography,…)[[60]](#footnote-60). Cultural evolution became a popular subject of study, meaning that questions related to how an educational concept evolved throughout time in a specific country or how educational practices have traveled across the world have increasingly been studied[[61]](#footnote-61). Such studies show that one of the concerns of New Culture of History of Education is to understand and counter forms of power that can be hidden in educational historiographies, but also in the educational system throughout time.

Following this definition, the use of voice could be considered as a cultural practice in education, which could also be considered as a potential source of power for the teacher. As the previous sections have shown, there has been little questioning of this precise fact that voice could hold a potential power. By focusing on voice within a framework of New Cultural History of Education, the aim of this thesis is therefore to add a new layer to different powers involved in education throughout history and to introduce a discussion on the potential power of the master’s voice.

On top of this theoretical framework, it is important to establish that this work is building further on a previous work done by Nick Calcoen for his master thesis at KU Leuven in the faculty of psychology and educational sciences. Through his archival research of some of the Belgian pedagogical journals written in Dutch and published between 1880 and 1940, his explorative work has described how the teacher’s voice was mentioned in them[[62]](#footnote-62). The present work is therefore a continuation of this exploration of how the voice of the teachers was presented from the end of the 19th century to the mid-20th century in Belgium. Based on the framework in which this thesis lies as well as the descriptive work already conducted by Nick Calcoen, the following questions will be addressed in this thesis:

How is the teacher’s voice presented in liberal and Catholic Belgian pedagogical journals written in French and published between 1880 and 1940?

Is there a difference in the presentation between the two educational approaches? And does the presentation of voice throughout time hint a problematization of it?

### 1.4.2. Time frame

The precise time frame chosen for this work starts in 1880 and ends in 1940. The beginning of this period is characterized by the School Wars (1878-1884) in the field of educational policy in Belgium[[63]](#footnote-63). This ideological war which opposed liberal and Catholic politicians on educational issues had resulted in many debates and decisions, such as the creation of an association of Catholic teachers[[64]](#footnote-64). Following this, the starting year of the studied period could have been set in 1878, to coincide with the beginning of the first School War and the legislative elections that took place that year and had shifted the political landscape from a Catholic one to a liberal one[[65]](#footnote-65). Nonetheless, 1880 was chosen as it was the year “the first state curriculum for public primary education was introduced in Belgium on 20 July”[[66]](#footnote-66). For this thesis, this year is thus considered as crucial as a new curriculum that was implemented to every school without exception is interesting in pedagogical terms: a curriculum also entails pedagogical practices and principles that go with it. This explains why, within a period that is marked with many political and pedagogical revisions, this specific year has been chosen as the starting year.

In terms of ending period, 1940 was chosen as this is right before the beginning of the Second World War which marks a turn in many aspects of society, including education.

### 1.4.3. The archives

In the limitations of his work, Nick Calcoen had suggested extending his observations by further investigating Belgian pedagogical journals written in French. French is one of Belgium’s official languages, and from the 19th to the middle of the 20th century, it was the dominant language of the country, meaning that it was the language used by socio-political elites[[67]](#footnote-67). From this, it can be deduced that many professionals who studied pedagogy in a scientific or philosophical approach would be highly educated and hence French-speaking. Therefore, as those pedagogues might have been highly likely to write articles in French, it could be interesting to investigate those writings.

In terms of the type of source material studied, pedagogical journals were chosen as the principal form of primary source to investigate the question addressed in this thesis. Evidently, the choice of this type of archive is partly due to the continuity of the present thesis, but it also naturally comes from the specificities that the research question induces. Because the thesis aims to investigate how vocal practices were communicated to teachers, there is a need to investigate archives that are addressed to teachers and, ideally, that were engaging them alongside other professionals of education in a discussion on the use of it. Based on this, pedagogical journals seem to be a better source of information than other written archives such as teacher’s diaries which only involve the teacher itself. Indeed, unlike diaries, pedagogical journals offer a wide range of information such as letters written by teachers to express an opinion and seek approval of the larger teacher community, narrations of teachers’ experiences, but also reports of pedagogical conferences and articles from pedagogical professionals such as psychologists. This means that pedagogical journals can give a variety of insight from descriptions of practices to depictions of actual teaching in class and more ideological arguments[[68]](#footnote-68).

A short word on the level of education chosen should also be mentioned. The thesis is focused on primary education as a continuation of Calcoen’s thesis, but also because primary education is believed to be the educational level in which educational beliefs are the most reflected and pedagogy is the most involved[[69]](#footnote-69). To conclude this section that introduced the research question, a last justification should also be given on the reason why the questions focus on Catholic and liberal journals. This is because as explained in the previous subsection, the investigated period was partly characterized by the School Wars which implied tensions between the two educational beliefs. Such confrontations were reflected in pedagogical journals, with many of them taking a political side and pleading for a public and neutral educational system or, on the contrary, explaining the importance of a religious one[[70]](#footnote-70). Moreover, it is known that the pedagogical landscape was also animated by other discussions during this period, starting from the education of students with mental disabilities or deaf-mutes or how the grades and the classes should be organized[[71]](#footnote-71). This is why the research question of the present thesis will be investigating whether this ideological clash also impacted the way pedagogical techniques – such as the use of the voice – were presented in pedagogical journals.

# Methodology

This second chapter will present all the archives that have been selected for this thesis. Before doing so, it will first provide some methodological clarification in terms of the steps followed to choose the pedagogical journals and articles that will be studied. To choose the archives that could help in answering the research questions, a first list of archives that could potentially be investigated was established based on the indexes written by De Vroede[[72]](#footnote-72). The existence of these indexes was known through the thesis of Nick Calcoen, as he had also based his archival selection on the four volumes written by De Vroede[[73]](#footnote-73). Those volumes compile lists of all known Belgian pedagogical journals published from 1978 to 1940. The indexes provide information on every Belgian journal that relates closely to education, meaning that the main topics of the listed journals vary from formal education to children’s rights or youth movements. The first step was thus to only consider the table that contained journals addressing primary education. From this, only journals written in French were kept. Once a list was established with the topic and language restrictions, every journal that did not fit in the time frame was naturally eliminated.

To maximize the efficiency of the process of data collection, some restrictions were also imposed for practical reasons. Journals that were not kept in university libraries or public libraries were not taken into account, and those who could be retrieved at the libraries of the university of Leuven and the Royal Library of Belgium were prioritized. The final important selection round consisted of a thorough review of the characteristics of each remaining journal. This has further eliminated any journals that were intended for teachers in a specific city or province, as those were limited to French-speaking cities and were probably not read by teachers in Flanders, or more broadly across the country. French versions of Dutch journals were also dismissed from the list for two reasons: Flemish teachers were more likely to read those journals in their original Dutch versions, and some of those original versions, namely *De Opvoeding* and *De Lagere Onderwijser*, were already investigated by Nick Calcoen[[74]](#footnote-74). Journals on specific forms of education such as musical education, agricultural education, vocational education and girls’ education were also discarded. Because the analysis of some journals such as *L’Abeille* (1855-1889)or *La Revue Pédagogique Belge* (1884-1895) did not lead to concluding information on the teacher’s voice, those were excluded from the analysis too.

The journals that remained were all liberal-oriented except for one (i.e. *L’école Catholique*). To guarantee a scientific validity of the thesis in terms of comparison between educational beliefs, another kind of archive was therefore added, namely pedagogical manuals. Manuals written from a Catholic perspective, which could compensate for the lack of Catholic archives, were firstly researched through the bibliographical part of the investigated journals. However, the manuals presented there were mainly practical manuals focusing on specific courses such as reading, grammar, arithmetic, history and geography. To obtain manuals that could give information about the teacher’s voice, a research was conducted on the platform of the university libraries of KU Leuven (Limo). The keyword ‘pedagogy’ was searched for, and several restrictions were implemented. The first limitation was in the publishing time (i.e. 1880 to 1940). The second restriction was in the place of publishing (i.e. Belgium). Lastly, the type of sources was limited to manuals.

The selected journals were consulted in two libraries. The first one is the Library of the Faculty of Psychology and Pedagogy in KU Leuven, which has a rich archive of pedagogical journals in its *Historische Collectie Psychologie en Pedagogisch Wetenschappen* (HCPPW). The other library used is the Royal Library of Belgium, which preserves an astounding number of Belgian historical documents in all sectors, of which pedagogical journals. Due to the fragility and scarcity of the archives, each of the physical copies were consulted in the libraries as they could not be borrowed. All the selected manuals were consulted at the HCPPW.

Before describing each selected archive, how articles were selected from each journal should also be specified. For this, two rounds were used. The first round consisted of going through the journals from the beginning to the end. This is because as almost no explicit mention of the word ‘voice’ was made in the articles’ titles listed in the table of content, a simple research in the list seemed insufficient. These first rounds were conducted with the first volumes of each journal chosen, in order to grasp what kind of articles would deal with the use of voice and hence, what keywords to look for. Once those were identified, a second round could take place, namely listing all pages containing articles related to pedagogy, obedience, children’s attention, ways to teach certain topics such as history or geography, and qualities that teachers were expected to have. The administrative sections, the practical sections on model lessons and the sections on varieties which most of the time contained articles from other countries were not investigated. Those would either not contain any information on the teacher’s voice or the information were irrelevant to the Belgian context. Articles on singing have also been removed from the list, as for the purpose of this thesis those are considered as specific kinds of education that make use of a distinct voice that the one used in everyday teaching.

## 2.1. Descriptions of journals

This section will present the characteristics of each journal chosen to discuss the research questions. It is indeed primordial for this thesis to understand the background of each journal in order to analyze the articles, as discourses can be highly different depending on political or confessional belief. Four journals were chosen to base this thesis on. Because the aim of this thesis is to compare whether there is a difference in the presentation of the teacher’s voice based on confessional belief, journals from both the Catholic and the liberal education were chosen. The first three presented below have a liberal orientation towards education, while the last one has a clear Catholic educational belief.

### 2.1.1. Le Progrès

*Le Progrès* is a pedagogical journal that was published by the teacher association called *Société Centrale des Instituteurs Belges* between 1861 and 1888[[75]](#footnote-75). From 1864 to 1888, the journal was published weekly, and its editorial team was composed of members of this association[[76]](#footnote-76). The journal aimed to be as open-minded as possible and accepted contributions from many teachers as long as they were not a direct attack to someone[[77]](#footnote-77). Despite its affiliation to the French-speaking society the journal is known to have been distributed across the whole country. This can be seen by the fact that it published some contributions from Flemish readers, although similarly to many French journals it is clear that there was a majority of French-speaking readers, especially towards the end of its existence. This period also coincides with the period where more articles on psychology were published. In terms of confessional belief, the openness of the journal should be pointed out, as their first aim was to improve education thanks to the strength of every teacher, regardless of their religious and political belief or language[[78]](#footnote-78). Despite this open-mindedness, it was not a Catholic journal and it has precisely lost a significant part of its Catholic readers as it has defended a rather liberal-oriented education during the School War[[79]](#footnote-79).

The first two volumes that fit into the time frame studied in this theses, namely the volumes from 1880 and 1881, were consulted at the Artes University library of Leuven. The remaining volumes from 1883 to 1887 were consulted at the Royal Library of Belgium. It should be noted that those volumes are only conserved in micro-film format, which made the investigation of the table of content more complicated. Those volumes were therefore consulted one by one. 14 articles were chosen for the final analysis.

### 2.1.2. Moniteur des instituteurs primaires

The journal started to be published as a small magazine with articles written by a group of teachers from Brussels in 1872[[80]](#footnote-80). The journal is still running today, despite some breaks during the First World War and the Second World War. From 1876 to 1914 the journal was published weekly, and from 1919 to 1956 it appeared semi-monthly[[81]](#footnote-81). The director of the journal was also one of the main contributors, but his writings had considerably decreased as the journal had gradually grown after the First School War, including an increasing number of contributions from professionals in psychology and pedagogy[[82]](#footnote-82). The director was trained in an episcopal college, and this confessional belief is visible by some of its references to religiosity and God[[83]](#footnote-83). However, following the School War, it has defended public education and has criticized some of the positions of Catholic education, which subsequently made the journal align with liberal education. Although there is no clear mention of geographical distribution of the journal, it can be supposed that the journal also addressed a Flemish audience, as some bibliography presents Dutch manuals, and some translations are provided in Dutch between brackets for more technical words such as animal names.

The HCPPW conserves volumes from 1955 to 1961, and although incomplete they also have a significant number of volumes from 1880 to 1884, from 1929 as well as some older numbers from 1872 and 1873. The volumes between 1880 and 1929 were consulted in the HCPPW. The Royal Library of Belgium conserves the volumes of 1901 and 1902, hence both were consulted there. Eight articles were chosen to be part of the analysis. Most of them come from the volumes of 1901 or 1902, as most of the volumes published from 1880 to 1884 contained a majority or administrative article as well as model lessons. It should also be specified that despite the weekly publishing, the length of the volumes between 1880 and 1804 was the shortest amongst all the journals.

### 2.1.3. L’Ecole belge

*L’Ecole belge* is a journal that was published weekly by the publishing company Defrense from 1909 to 1913[[84]](#footnote-84). The journal was composed of a theoretical part, a more administrative part explaining teacher’s rights and laws regarding their profession, and model lessons alongside letters from readers. Despite its commercial purpose, the characteristic of this journal is that it extensively presented conference works from every province in Belgium, with the aim to help teachers to have a clear and conceived overview of what was discussed in those conferences each week. The journal was also addressing adult education, girls’ education and kindergarten education. The journal was highly concerned with teachers positions and had for instance pleaded for winter holidays as well as for smaller classes, and were in these instances criticizing the sciences of pedagogy as it argued that classes with less students would solve some of the pedagogical issues. Despite the journal’s neutrality in terms of politics, it still defended some points such as the teachers’ material conditions and compulsory education, making it more liberal-oriented. Conference work from Flemish provinces were sometimes translated into French or presented in their original forms in Dutch from 1910, confirming the Flemish readership of this journal.

43 articles were thoroughly read from the five volumes. Most of them were conference works, others were articles on pedagogy, and some letters dealing with discipline were also investigated. Those related to speaking disabilities were discarded, and many of the articles that dealt with the teaching of the mother tongue were also eliminated as they did not deal with the teacher’s voice but more with the correct pronunciation that children had to produce. This led to the retention of nine articles to be analyzed.

### 2.1.4. L’école Catholique

*L’école Catholique* is a Catholic pedagogical journal that was published semi-monthly. It was first published in 1881, and its last volume appeared in 1893. All the volumes were found and consulted at the HCPPW in Leuven. The editorial part was handled by teachers from the training institutes founded by J.B. de La Salle in Carlsbourg and Malonne[[85]](#footnote-85). The journal’s main aim was to help pedagogues in bringing children up into a Catholic education[[86]](#footnote-86). Every number started with a few pages on pedagogy, and every number finished with a section called “variety” where educational practices and policies from other countries as well as official documents on the Belgian educational system were presented. A significant amount of pages were dedicated to practical model lessons, but there was also a pedagogical section in which indications on how to educate religious children were developed. Although the journal did not explicitly position itself concerning the School War, it criticized the lack of teachers’ authority in the liberal education.

108 articles were investigated across the 11 consulted volumes. The articles come from the pedagogical section of the journal, and most of them dealt with attention, obedience, and authority. Because many of them were dealing with how children needed to behave, only ten articles which explicitly dealt with voice and ways to express ideas vocally were chosen for the final analysis.

## 2.2. Description of manuals

Because the pedagogical journals that were available were mainly liberal, manuals with a Catholic vision on education were chosen. This section will briefly present them.

### 2.2.1. Traité théorique et pratique de méthodologie

Written by Achille V. A., a professor from the Ecole Normale Catholique of Carlsbourg, this manual was mentioned in the bibliography of the journal *L’Ecole Catholique*[[87]](#footnote-87). Although several editions of the manual were found in the HCPPW, the fourth edition published in 1882 which was advertised in the journal was chosen to stay consistent with the time frame and the investigated audience. The introduction emphasized the scientific aspects of pedagogy and methodology as well as its practical side. In that way, the author indicated that although this manual presented the theory, it also included examples of actual classes. It also argued that the teacher-students needed to practice the theory to be truly competent in terms of pedagogy. The chapter consulted for this thesis is the second chapter named ‘didactics’, which developed how the teaching should be conducted, as well as the chapter on teaching forms.

### 2.2.2. Résumé du cours de pédagogie par un ancien directeur d’école normale

Jean Nicolas Joseph Pirenne, a former director of an école normal, wrote and published this manual in 1880. When he published the manual, Pirenne was working as a teacher at a seminary school in Saint-Trond. Moreover, on the cover of the book, it is specified that the manual was approved by the bishop of Liège and was followed by the schools in the diocese of Liège. Although there is not much information about the author of this manual, the preface mentions his belief in terms of education. Following him, education is about pedagogy, methodology, qualities that the teacher should have and discipline. The book hence develops these points, with an emphasis on religious education. The consulted pages come from the chapter on teaching methods and on moral education.

### 2.2.3. Quelques directions méthodologiques pour le personnel des écoles primaires et les maîtresses Frœbéliennes

This manual was written and published in 1905 by A. Flamant, a cantonal inspector of primary education. In the preface, the author mentioned that he had written the manual based on instructions that he has given to teachers in the canton of La Louvière. The manual was mentioned in the monograph *La pédagogie classique et la pédagogie expérimentale* that was published by F. Collard, a professor at the University of Leuven, in 1910[[88]](#footnote-88). He was the president of the *Cercle pédagogique des professeurs de l’enseignement moyen sortis de l’Université de Louvain* and was passionate about discussions on pedagogy[[89]](#footnote-89). Collard’s manual defended the importance of the ‘classic’ pedagogy, in opposition to a new branch of this sciences that was branded as more modern and less monotone, and to do so it described how pedagogy and teaching needed to be[[90]](#footnote-90). As a manual that could further educate those interested in the classic pedagogy, Collard had presented the manual written by Flamant. Because Collard was a professor at the university of Leuven, which in 1910 was still uniting French-speaking and Dutch-speaking students, it could be argued that his manual could have been read by both readerships. As a consequence, it is likely that Flamant’s manual was also read across the country.

### 2.2.4.Cours complet de pédagogie et de méthodologie

The manual was published in 1885 and written by Johann Thomas Braun. Braun was an inspector of the Ecoles Normales de Belgique as well as the editor of the pedagogical journal *L’Abeille[[91]](#footnote-91)*. This manual was not found through the bibliography of the investigated pedagogical journals, but because the journal that Braun was editing also targeted the Flemish teachers, it could be assumed that his book was also read by teachers and teacher-students in the Flemish part of Belgium. The introduction mentions that this manual was written following the changes of laws in 1884, which led the manuals that Braun had published before this to become non-relevant. Moreover, as this book was mainly aimed at students who followed teaching training, the aim was to condense the knowledge and the applications that would conform to the new law into a single book, in order to make the price of the manual affordable. The chapter consulted was the fifth one on general methodology, which goes over the qualities and aptitudes a teacher should have.

## 2.3. Time frame of journals

Despite the original time frame including the interwar period, the journals and monographs that were kept for the analysis were only published until right before the First World War. Several reasons can be raised for this choice. Firstly, this is because some volumes of journals published before the Second World War were simply not kept in archives. This was the case for the Catholic journal *L’éducateur belge*, despite the journal being published from the 19th century. This was also the case for other journals, such as *Moniteur des instituteurs primaires*, from which the only interwar period volumes that remained today are the ones from 1929. Lastly, many of the scarce journals that were published during the interwar period and available at the HCPPW are local journals, such as *Cahiers de pédagogie*, published between 1935 and 1964 which contains articles written by students and alumni of the *Institut Supérieur de Pédagogie de Liège*; or *Bulletin des écoles primaires*, started in 1882 and still published today, which was addressing Catholic educators in the province of Hainaut.

# Voice to teach

This chapter will develop on the way the teacher’s voice was presented in terms of the various vocal practices that were recommended to them. Those practices were often defended by the fact that they were effective in keeping students’ attention, and keeping students’ attention precisely seemed to be a primary preoccupation of many pedagogical authors. Along those lines, while an emphasis was made on the need and benefit of education for children in the age to attend primary school, being attentive to classes was presented as something that did not occur naturally in children[[92]](#footnote-92). For this reason, many of the articles dealing with teachers’ voices encouraged teachers to find ways that could lead children to stay focused and to care about their learning. This implies that teachers’ voice was considered as a crucial tool to steer pupils’ attention and to create a flow that would make children naturally focus on the lesson content. The following three subsections will present those techniques that were suggested by journals and manuals.

## 3.1. Voice tone

« A school master who teaches or scolds students in a voice uniformly thunderous will not be listened to. But, if he can go by a nuanced graduation, with energetic tones from solemn to soft, he will be sure to awaken a sustained attention. »[[93]](#footnote-93)

The most crucial practice advocated in a majority of journals was to vary the speaking tone and to nuance the voice[[94]](#footnote-94). In other words, teachers were advised to avoid speaking with the same constant tone that was qualified as monotone. It should be noted that in some cases the rather monotone voice was accepted. In that way, an even voice tone was often associated with a teaching style that was expository, a style that often involved mere juxtaposition of arguments and sentences. Following *L’Ecole belge* and several manuals, such a teaching style was deemed suitable for older students who could stay focused for longer periods of time[[95]](#footnote-95). Nonetheless, although the expository style was presented as something that could also be used with young students, its abuse was condemned as the monotone voice was believed to make children sleepy and to let their attention gear away. In that way, Pirenne explained that when students’ imagination was not activated, they could not pay attention to the teachers’ arguments for long periods of time and hence would not pay attention to the teacher[[96]](#footnote-96). Consequently, there was a need for teachers to find a voice tone that could speak to children’s imagination[[97]](#footnote-97). That recommended tone was mostly qualified with adjectives such as “pleasant”, “clear” or “sonorous”[[98]](#footnote-98), in opposition to the dull voice tone. Achille V.A. summarized this in his manual by the following sentence: “If the tone of the voice should not be declamatory, it should not be monotone either, but expressive and varied”[[99]](#footnote-99). Moreover, to have such an expressive tone, teachers were also required to have a vivid imagination as without this, it would be challenging to employ a colorful tone of voice that could appeal to children by bringing the teaching content to life[[100]](#footnote-100).

Adding to this, instead of a presentation in a declarative voice tone, articles defended the need to actively engage younger students, both to keep them focused and to make sure that they understood what was transmitted to them. On top of activating students’ imagination, this could be achieved by regularly asking them questions. After the transmission of knowledge, interrogating students was thus presented as the next most crucial skill that a teacher should have. Although the interrogative style was more often presented in terms of content (i.e. how to make a good question), asking questions also required a specific tone of voice that would help teachers to interrogate students clearly so they would understand the actual question[[101]](#footnote-101). One of the examples raised by Achille V.A. was to accentuate the word in the question to which the answer should relate[[102]](#footnote-102). The interrogative style was however not appropriate for every subject, and authors emphasized the importance of varying teaching styles and appropriate tone of voice[[103]](#footnote-103). Ultimately, the conversational tone was considered the best as it was a mix of the voice tone used in the expository and interrogative styles, meaning that variation was guaranteed[[104]](#footnote-104). This tone was also advised because it was argued to be the closest to an authentic discussion between individuals. To conclude, teachers were advised not to use too serious voice tones, while not becoming too puerile or theatrical either[[105]](#footnote-105).

## 3.2. Course specific tone

Adding to this warm voice tone that was close to the natural conversational tone and that activated students’ imagination, teachers had another task regarding their voice tone. Indeed, teachers were also expected to be aware of the subject they were teaching, because some subjects required a specific tone that was considered as optimal to convey the essence of the course. In other words, the cheerfulness or the solemnity of the voice needed to be adjusted according to the nature of the subject[[106]](#footnote-106). Five examples of such pairs of subject and voice tone could be found across the journals.

The first course, which was mentioned in several journals, was history. The tone that was advised for this course was an eloquent tone that would cultivate a sense of patriotism amongst students[[107]](#footnote-107). Because one of the aims of the history lessons was for children to appreciate their motherland and its past, imagination was very significant in this course: if children could picture their country’s past as epic, the teachers were considered to have succeeded in their historical education. To fulfill this, the teachers’ voice tone should be something more elevated than the usual familiar tone, as teachers needed to be solemn to transmit a certain passion for their homeland[[108]](#footnote-108). The tone that accompanied the history class was thus solemn, eloquent and passionate[[109]](#footnote-109). Similarly to this, it was believed that geography lessons were better taught by means of a colorful and picturesque tone that would help pupils to visualize the different locations[[110]](#footnote-110).

The third course was arithmetic, which consisted mostly of formulas, rules and demonstrations. This school subject was only mentioned by *L’Ecole belge*, which explained that because arithmetic was mostly based on the memorisation of the formulas, teachers needed to use concise and sharp explanations[[111]](#footnote-111). Here again, the familiar tone used in daily teacher-student interactions had to be abandoned. Instead, a rather drier tone was deemed more appropriate. Sciences was the third subject and was mentioned by *Le Progrès*[[112]](#footnote-112). In this course, teachers were advised to opt for voice tones that could transmit the greatness of inventions that allowed our societies to make progress.This suggestion resembled the one made for history classes, although the need for eloquence and solemnness was less emphasized and instead, an expressive voice that stimulated pupils’ imagination to think innovatively was accentuated. Lastly, strengthening the willingness to read was also under the teachers’ responsibilities. Once again, the tone that was advocated here was warm and lively: if the teacher took such a tone of voice, it was easier for children to imagine the fictional world of the book, which in turn could motivate them to read more[[113]](#footnote-113).

## 3.3. Voice intensity

Not only did the teachers’ speech need to be pleasant to listen to, but there was also a need to assure that the pupils memorized the course content. The teachers’ role was indeed not limited to conveying information, it also comprised making students assimilate course content. This was often encouraged to be done by accentuating the most important points of an explanation[[114]](#footnote-114). By making some sudden changes in the intensity of the voice, teachers could catch students’ attention and mark their mind. Such unpredictable variations were also considered as indispensable for children to actively listen to their teachers[[115]](#footnote-115). By the use of their voice, teachers were therefore able to “produce what draws attention: intensity and variation of intensity, suddenness”[[116]](#footnote-116). This joins the idea conveyed in articles that, although it was important to engage students through their vision (e.g. by writing on a board), the hearing sense was also important for children to be engaged in the learning process[[117]](#footnote-117). Along those lines, students who were merely hearing the information and were not processing it were problematized. The variation of intensity was considered as part of the solution for such issues. More specifically, teachers were strongly encouraged to emphasize the key concepts of the teaching subject, as by doing this, it was believed that pupils would better understand what was important to understand and to remember [[118]](#footnote-118).

The volume of the teachers' voice was also a parameter that could be modified to catch student's attention. In most cases, to speak with a low voice was a technique suggested as a way to naturally force students to be focused on the teacher: students needed to become silent to hear and follow the lesson[[119]](#footnote-119). This is why it was emphasized that teachers should not continue giving classes when the students were too loud[[120]](#footnote-120). *Moniteur des instituteurs primaires* argued that if needed, the teachers could ask for silence, but they were not advised to raise their voice when doing so[[121]](#footnote-121). Extremes should nonetheless be excluded, as speaking too low would incite the opposite outcome : students would not hear the teacher and would therefore get distracted as it created an opportunity for them to chat with peers or to daydream[[122]](#footnote-122). Those techniques were believed to be effective to keep the class quietly focused on the explanations, but they were also considered as best for the teacher’s health, as this would help them to avoid using their vocal cords too much[[123]](#footnote-123).

# Voice and language

« If we ignored that human beings were created to live in an intelligent and enlightened society, the gift of speech solely would teach it to us. »[[124]](#footnote-124)

When talking about the teacher’s voice, many of the articles mentioned words such as ‘language’ or ‘speech’ more often than the word ‘voice’ [[125]](#footnote-125). It is however difficult to neglect those articles based on the sole reason that they rarely mention the word ‘voice’. This is because the articles showed that especially in French, those words are often used interchangeably and are hence difficult to disentangle. Connected to this, even if those articles were more focused on the teacher’s speech, they were still dealing with vocal practices through pedagogical advice related to speech and language. It is also important to keep in mind that without voice, there is no language nor speech, and hence those words are very closely intertwined although not pointing to the same concept. Following these arguments and the importance that was accorded to speech across journals, this chapter deals with the presentation of the teachers’ voice by addressing the articles that focused more on the teachers’ speech.

## 4.1. His master’s authority

The importance given to students’ attention was developed in the previous chapter. This section will add a layer to this need for student’s attention as this presupposes a certain calmness and order in class. Indeed, it is important to note that in cases where the students were not disciplined in the first place, it was challenging to call for attention and to instruct effectively. This is why teachers were often required to use their voice to instill authority in the class and hence make an environment in which children would focus on the transmitted knowledge. Just as catching students’ attention, asserting the teacher’s authority did not seem to be a simple task. This section will develop on articles that were dealing with the teachers’ speech and how it could affect the teachers’ authority.

### 4.1.1. Firmness and kindness

« It is a terrible illusion to believe that the teacher who shouts the longest and the loudest obtains the best results. The big secret is to be able to find the words and the tone of the voice that is the most suitable to enlighten the student’s spirit and to touch its heart. »[[126]](#footnote-126)

*L’école Catholique* explained to teachers that asserting their authority in class was not about punishing every misbehavior and communicating harshness in the voice tone[[127]](#footnote-127). Indeed, they compared such ways to impose the teacher’s superiority to tamers who were relentless towards the lions they were training[[128]](#footnote-128). Such authority could lead students to behave well by remaining silent in class and accomplishing the demanded tasks, but according to the journal, the students would only obey in order to avoid the painful consequences and would thus not acknowledge a “legitimate power” in the teacher[[129]](#footnote-129). Instead of communicating such strictness in the voice, the most efficient way to assert teachers’ authority seemed to communicate a sense of seriousness and firmness while maintaining a form of kindness in their voice[[130]](#footnote-130). Similarly to the argument presented in the article of L’école Catholique, *Le* *Progrès* added that shouting and screaming, which were seen as the essence of anger, were pointless and ineffective[[131]](#footnote-131). This was due to the following two reasons: on the one hand, students might become scared of their teacher and obey out of fear, which did not make them learn what their mistakes were. On the other hand, the use of a loud voice disrupted students’ attention, and if the teacher thought that speaking with a loud voice would help in keeping students focused, articles often stated the opposite: as explained earlier (see 3.1.2), lower voices were viewed as naturally leading students to stop chatting, and by raising their voice it was argued that teachers risked falling in a vicious circle. Children would raise their voice to chat in order to surpass the teacher’s volume, but the teacher would also raise his voice volume. Soon this would lead the teacher to punish students, and because this alienated students, they would listen less and less to the teacher’s explanation, resulting in even more irritation and punishment from the teacher.

Adding to the shouting which relates more to the volume of the authoritative voice, voice tones could also convey a certain authority that might not be the best in terms of pedagogy.This was argued by *Moniteur des instituteurs primaire,* which added that a firm tone of voice should however not convey a bad mood, as it would even be counterproductive by alienating students from the teacher and, subsequently, from the learning[[132]](#footnote-132). Another article in *L’Ecole Catholique* followed this line of thinking by further developing that when teachers scold students, they should not transmit any form of “impatience, antipathy or any other form of passion that is badly configured” [[133]](#footnote-133). The article argued that otherwise, God would not bless the teacher’s effort to discipline its students and the students would not understand their misconduct[[134]](#footnote-134). To avoid transmitting such feelings, and because alienating the students from the teacher was depicted as a way to turn them away from studying, the need to keep a kindness in the voice was strongly advocated. For example, Braun and Achille V.A. both made such a case in their manual, by recommending teachers not to let disappointment be sensed in their voice when children made mistakes, even if those were repeated[[135]](#footnote-135). This joins the claims made in some journals that teachers should never show any signs of impatience in their voice, as those often led teachers to become irritated and to raise their voice, which did not help pupils in stopping to disrupt the class[[136]](#footnote-136).

Despite the plea to show kindness towards students by means of voice tone, articles also cautioned teachers who seemed too approachable to students. Following them, speaking in a too light and puerile tone was detrimental to the authority that the teacher had, as students would not respect their teacher anymore[[137]](#footnote-137). Authors of manuals such as Braun indeed made clear that pupils prefer a teacher who seems self-assured and not easily influenceable[[138]](#footnote-138). Hence, although feelings such as disappointment or impatience should not be reflected in the teacher’s voice, teachers were also dissuaded from using a voice tone that was translating a “honeyed indulgence” [[139]](#footnote-139). Put together, the teacher’s tone should be amical as a teacher who is loved by its students is more likely to be respected and seen as a legitimate authority. However, the teacher should find the right balance between firmness and friendliness, because as soon as they lean too much towards one extreme, they risk losing their ascendancy over children and hence needing to instill discipline again. This was especially emphasized as it could easily become a vicious circle in which teachers end up shouting because of an unruly classroom.

### 4.1.2. Passion and practice

Connected to this balance between firmness and kindness was the teachers’ passion for the profession, which includes the act of teaching, the relationship with children and curiosity towards the teaching content. This passion was considered as a way for teachers to keep their authority on students, as articles described how the ardent teacher would naturally talk with a “warm”[[140]](#footnote-140) voice that would bring its explanations to life[[141]](#footnote-141). This kind of tone was believed to ignite the students’ interest for the teacher’s explanations and hence keep a class of disciplined students who would listen carefully to the teacher and respect him. Braun argued that if teachers did not show such kind of dignity towards their profession, it would be felt in his voice and could then negatively impact his students’ achievements, even if the teacher was knowledgeable[[142]](#footnote-142). He further explained that the passion to teach was difficult to fake, and teachers who did not truly enjoy the teaching would often speak with a tone that was exaggeratedly theatrical, not spontaneous nor authentic[[143]](#footnote-143). Students would rapidly feel that the teacher is not truly passionate about his practice, leading them to lose interest in the teaching content and often ultimately lead to poor outcomes[[144]](#footnote-144). Likewise, *L’Ecole belge* warned teachers that they should not push too far the expressions of passions and eloquence despite their enthusiasm towards the transmission of knowledge, because this could tire and bore the students[[145]](#footnote-145). There was thus a need for teachers to be sincerely passionate about teaching, yet they needed to be aware of the limits. This was important as it would contribute to the assertion of the teacher’s authority, as students would come to admire their teacher.

«The talent of speech, indispensable for those who want to teach, can only be the fruit of a lot of preparatory exercises and of a habit contracted long in advance »[[146]](#footnote-146)

Although passion might have naturally influenced the voice, it had to be combined with a thorough practice of it. Along those lines, articles emphasized two points around teachers’ need to practice. The first, illustrated by the above quote, is the need for teachers to practice their speech skills. This could indicate the fact that speaking correctly in class, in other words, using the right voice tone at the right moment was not solely natural. It could have been described as something that was gained through experience[[147]](#footnote-147). *L’Ecole belge accentuated* this by stating that “the master has the duty to cultivate in himself the art of the speech”[[148]](#footnote-148), and this idea was further reflected in the manuals that named a correct speech as an indispensable quality that teachers should have[[149]](#footnote-149). The art of speaking in class was thus considered as a teacher’s basic skill that should continuously be worked on and never be neglected throughout the career.

### 4.1.3. Preparation

Articles argued that passion and practice would naturally lead teachers to feel the necessity to prepare their lessons in advance[[150]](#footnote-150). This preparation was considered essential for teachers’ speech because it would significantly influence their confidence and speaking speed. Articles were henceforth repeatedly advising teachers to regularly read in order to update their knowledge and be prepared. On the one hand, this meant that teachers should read well-written novels and essays to cultivate their vocabulary and enrich it[[151]](#footnote-151). On the other hand, pedagogical journals strongly recommended teachers to keep reading them as they offered scientific knowledge that were regularly updated[[152]](#footnote-152). By combining both knowledge, teachers were able to give articulated explanations to children. This would notably facilitate the teacher’s task to distinguish crucial and more subordinate information and hence teachers were able to emphasize on the correct information[[153]](#footnote-153).

The preparation in terms of knowledge update was also closely connected to the fluidity of the teacher’s speech. To illustrate this, an article of *Le Progrès* explained the vicious circle that could emerge from a lack of preparation: insufficient preparation would lead a teacher to speak with hesitations and his explanations would not follow a straight line[[154]](#footnote-154). Students would not be able to follow their teacher’s train of thoughts and would rapidly become bored, and because bored students tend to misbehave, teachers would have to become stricter and to impose punishments as an attempt to keep class order. This was however not to say that teachers’ explanations should have been rapid, as this could also make children lose the tracks. Journals advised teachers to maintain a relatively slow pace, but contrary to the slow pace of the unprepared teacher, the correct pace should have been consistent and adjusted to the pupils’ intelligence[[155]](#footnote-155). *Le Progrès* concluded its article by explaining that a teacher who could give clear explanations would be respected and listened to, because students would see him as a superior being who had knowledge and the means to transmit it. By exposing this, the article implicitly encouraged teachers to prepare classes thoroughly to have a smooth speed and flowing arguments.

## 4.2. Communication between souls

The concerns developed in the previous section seem to be deeply connected to the affective and emotional side of what teaching implies. Indeed, the fact that a teacher’s passion towards the school subject or his love towards his students should be felt in his voice infers that voice needed to be used as a means to convey such devotion. Because voice could be used to communicate such feelings, it seems that voice and the teacher’s consciousness, or in other words his soul, were closely connected. The following four sections will develop articles that mentioned such a relationship between the teacher’s voice and the soul.

### 4.2.1. Communication between souls

« Because finally, the communication of the soul only operates by the intermediary of the body, of sensible signs; the more thus this instrument is perfect the stronger and the more perfect would its action be » [[156]](#footnote-156)

This quote coming from *L’école Catholique* seems to confirm this inference that the voice and the soul were believed to connect closely. Although voice is not explicitly mentioned here, it is a part of the body, and hence it could be deduced that voice was significant to communicate what lied inside the teacher’s soul. This seems plausible as an article in *Le Progrès* emphasized the idea that speech was a unique characteristic of human beings and that it is the main means to communicate ideas, which in turn can shape and develop one’s soul[[157]](#footnote-157). Although those articles did not make a direct link with the teacher’s voice and this particularity of the voice, it could be deduced that since those articles are published in pedagogical journals, they instructed teachers about the role of their voice to some extent. This can be supported by the article from L’école Catholique, which defined some of the aspects of a teacher’s soul further in this article: according to it, those were “firmness, patience, softness, constancy, impartiality, silence, dexterity, vigilance, passion, foresight and generosity”, and the teachers needed to communicate such aspects of their spirits during class[[158]](#footnote-158). Many of the words used to label aspects of the teacher’s soul resemble those employed in the previous section, which again implies that the teacher’s voice specifically needed to convey such parts of his soul to have a class that was deemed as high quality.

Not only did the teacher need to convey aspects of his soul by his voice, but he also needed to touch his pupil’s soul. This was formulated by a teacher from the province of Limburg in *L’Ecole belge* as follows: “The speech of the master is lively, by its animation and its expression, it talks to an imagination, to a spirit, to a child’s heart”[[159]](#footnote-159). This need to use his voice as a way to stimulate pupil’s spirit was reaffirmed in *Le Progrès*. Following them, one of the teacher’s duties was to actively feed pupils’ souls by putting movement in their teaching[[160]](#footnote-160). By movement, the article pointed to the necessity to ask questions to students and to vary the speaking tone. In that way, the teacher was strongly advised to give classes with a dynamic tone that would wake up the students and invite them to participate in the class by thinking together with the teacher[[161]](#footnote-161). This supported further the need to activate the student’s imagination developed in the previous chapter. Nonetheless, while in the previous chapter this was advocated in terms of keeping student’s attention, the article in *Le Progrès* presented this in a rather spiritual way. In that way, the teacher was considered as the soul – in other words, the center – of the classroom dynamic, meaning that if the teacher lacked energy, the whole class risked being apathetic. Achille V.A. also seemed to agree with this link between teacher and pupils’ souls, as he explained that a teacher’s guidance needed to enlighten its pupils’ spirit[[162]](#footnote-162). To conclude, articles showed that on the one hand teachers’ speech reflected their soul, and on the other hand the teachers’ and pupils’ souls were continuously communicating during class, with the teacher’s spirit guiding the pedagogical process. For this reason, journals asked teachers to mind their speech.

### 4.2.2. The lively speech

« This one [the voice] lives, resonates, affects – that one [the book] sends off to sleep, it is mute for a lot and inanimate :

she [the voice] forces collective attention – he [the book] leaves you for yourself ;

she nuances the salient points, he has a uniform tone that does not distinguish the essence from the details, nor the secondary to the necessary;

she enlightens the obscurity in knowledge and stops to dissipate them in the light, he affirms and passes by » [[163]](#footnote-163)

Connected to this vocal communication between souls is how articles and manuals gave importance to the teachers’ voice, especially when compared to written sources of information such as books. In that way, Flament made a fervent plea for teachers to prioritize the use of their voice when teaching. Despite the multiple references to the power of the master’s gaze and the importance of having a visual representation of the teaching subject[[164]](#footnote-164), Flament explained that the book should only be a guide for both teachers and students[[165]](#footnote-165). Teachers could use it to build up their explanations, to borrow graphs and visual representations, but it should not replace the voice. The link between voice and soul can also be made here as Flament justified his plea by comparing the book to chains that were limiting the teacher, especially by removing the personality of the teacher’s lesson. For him, the lessons given by the teacher’s voice represented its “force and living beauty of its exposé”.

Journal articles also mentioned the importance of teachers’ speech: for *L’Ecole belge*, teachers’ speech was crucial for moral education because it was believed to be the only tool that could move students[[166]](#footnote-166). Hence, voice appeared as the only instrument that could lead students to take good resolutions. This means that the written words that students read themselves were not considered as powerful enough to mark the students’ spirit, something that the teacher’s voice could do thanks to its different tones and intentions. The same article also qualified the information contained in a book as “cold”[[167]](#footnote-167), which was opposed to the voice that was qualified as warm throughout different journals and manuals. Because of this coldness, *L’Ecole belge* argued that children would have more hardships to remember such printed information, while facts transmitted through the teachers’ voice would remain longer in children’s minds[[168]](#footnote-168). By conveying deep feelings that lied in the teacher’s soul, the teacher’s voice was therefore considered as a better tool to teach pupils.

### 4.2.3. The essence of teaching

The seemingly crucial status of speech that was upheld throughout the investigated journals and manuals so far could be summed up by the following quote found in *L’Ecole belge*: “The language is the soul of the teaching, it is central. (…) the speech is thus, by far, the first means to teach”[[169]](#footnote-169). Another article in the same journal advocated a similar opinion by stating that education was in fact happening all-day-long since it was embodied in the teachers’ speech[[170]](#footnote-170). On a similar note, Achille V.A. had defined the practice of teaching as “the methodological transmission of knowledge by means of example and speech”, and that hence the everyday speech of the teacher was in itself the best language lesson that pupils could have[[171]](#footnote-171). Consequently, articles were advising teachers to take care of the way they spoke as children would unconsciously learn from their master’s speech and imitate them[[172]](#footnote-172). More specifically, two aspects of the teachers’ speech were often mentioned as the core to the pupils’ education: the pronunciation and the vocabulary. A remarkable stress was put on teachers’ pronunciation, as teachers were required to talk with a ‘pure’ accent, meaning that they were strongly dissuaded to use dialects while teaching[[173]](#footnote-173). The insistence on the pronunciation seemed to come from its demanding nature. Indeed, most of the pupils were speaking the local dialect at home and by extension in class[[174]](#footnote-174). Teachers needed to counter this and were warned not to be influenced by this. To go even further, teachers were suggested to avoid talking dialects with colleagues, to be sure to conserve their pure accent[[175]](#footnote-175). The pronunciation should nonetheless not be exaggerated as teachers needed to maintain an authentic speech that would not tire or distract pupils[[176]](#footnote-176).

In terms of vocabulary, a similar logic was applied: teachers were expected to use a noble vocabulary for children to learn from it and copy it[[177]](#footnote-177). This would lead children to naturally use a rich vocabulary, and this was part of the teachers’ duty to educate pupils in their mother tongue. *Moniteur des instituteurs primaires* warned teachers to find the right vocabulary to use, as words that were too complex would not be understood by the children, but puerile words would not serve the pupils[[178]](#footnote-178). The recommendation to use appropriate words was also linked to the teachers’ authority, as a balance between a likable figure and a confidence in terms of knowledge was considered best for teachers to keep their status vis-à-vis their students. Lastly, some other advice was given to teachers regarding their speech to remain a model for pupils. For example, an article from *Le Progrès* explained that if teachers wanted to have discipline and order in their classroom, they needed to be the model and talk the right amount by only expressing what was necessary[[179]](#footnote-179). The voice tone was also something that children would mimic, and hence teachers should not use a singing tone nor a piercing voice[[180]](#footnote-180). Since students integrate how to speak by listening to their teachers, teachers were advised to give the right example by opting for a “male firm intonation, [which was] non melodious”[[181]](#footnote-181)

### 4.2.4. A mere vehicle

Despite the defense of speech as indispensable for teaching, it seemed that not every professional of pedagogy agreed with these kinds of statements. In that regard, voice was also presented as a mere vehicle for the words that are used to teach. The amount of articles that used the broader term of ‘speech’ instead of ‘voice’ is already hinting at such an assumption, as they seem to give more importance to the content instead of the form of the communication [[182]](#footnote-182). A concrete example of such ideas can be found in the following quote: “In lessons, the master’s speech should not be the essence, the substance of the lesson ; it should only be a support, a guide, a help”[[183]](#footnote-183). Because this quote was also found in *L’Ecole belge* – which has advocated in the previous section that the teacher’s speech was key to teaching – it shows that the teacher’s voice was a disputed tool.

While defenders of voice as a crucial tool considered that without voice there was no education, their opponent believed that the teacher’s voice was solely a means to transmit the lesson subject to pupils’ minds. The essence of the lesson, as the author qualified it, was nature[[184]](#footnote-184). In this case, the teacher’s voice was thus considered more as a vehicle to comment on the objects rather than the center of the teaching. This is probably why many articles only mentioned a few sentences on how the teachers had to make use of their voice, as the voice was considered as part of wide-ranging techniques to exploit in order to effectively transmit the knowledge. Another reason that could explain the presentation of voice as a mere vehicle is the fact that many articles warned teachers not to talk too much[[185]](#footnote-185). Those articles explained that if the teacher explained too much, the pupils would not actively participate and hence, their attention would slip away. Teachers should also not be pretentious and willing to show off their knowledge, hence, they were advised to limit the amount of their speech.

# Discussion

This last chapter will be divided into two sections. The first will discuss what has emerged throughout the findings by linking it to the existing literature. By doing this, the first section will also answer the research questions. Following this, the final section will elaborate on limitations and further suggestions for historical research around the teacher’s voice.

## 5.1. Conclusion

The purpose of this thesis was twofold. The first aim was to investigate Belgian Catholic and liberal pedagogical journals written in French and published between 1880 and 1940 to analyze how the teacher’s voice was presented, as well as whether this presentation could be defined as a problematization. The second research question was to investigate whether there was a difference between the description and potential problematization of the teacher’s voice between the two educational beliefs.

Regarding the first part of the first question, the teacher’s voice in the investigated journal articles and manuals was often presented in terms of a didactic and pedagogical tool to transmit the knowledge smoothly. In that way, the studied articles and manuals have repeatedly emphasized the importance for teachers to vary their tone of voice and volume in order to maintain students’ attention. This is in accordance with the conclusion in the thesis of Nick Calcoen: in his exploratory study, he found that in Flemish pedagogical journals published between 1880 and 1940, the teacher’s voice was described as a tool to spark children’s interest in learning[[186]](#footnote-186). In both this thesis and Calcoen’s thesis, the varying tones have been qualified by adjectives such as ‘warm’ or ‘firm’ to give teachers an idea of the desired voice tone. This has also been shown in Landahl’s study on Swedish teacher’s voice, meaning that in Sweden around the 1910’s, a similar plea for teachers to modulate their voice was made[[187]](#footnote-187).

Next, similarly to Calcoen’s thesis, a relationship between teacher’s voice and order in class has been found[[188]](#footnote-188). In that way, articles talked about how a teacher with a voice that was firm enough while still reflecting affection for the students would be respected by students. Because this meant that the teacher’s superiority was not asserted but rather naturally accepted by pupils, it would bring a certain order and a desirable studious atmosphere in class. The last similar point between Calcoen’s thesis and this investigation in French-written articles and manuals is the depiction of the teacher's voice as a model for their pupils[[189]](#footnote-189). Indeed, the teacher’s voice and speech needed to be an example for students to learn to speak properly, with a rich vocabulary and a neutral pronunciation. The aforementioned three points have thus already been observed in other research, and the present thesis confirms their importance in the investigated French-written Belgian pedagogical journals and manuals.

In contrast to those findings, this thesis has also its own unique contribution to the explorative historical research in teacher’s voice. Firstly, articles and manuals investigated have presented the teacher's voice as a pedagogical tool that was more capable of touching a pupil's imagination than other didactic material. In that way, a distinctive contribution is the description of different voices that were deemed suitable for different subjects. The course of history can exemplify this link the most. Indeed, this course aimed at cultivating a sense of patriotism and fascination with past events in students, which the teacher’s voice could do. In other words, it could be concluded that the teacher's voice was not presented as a mere vehicle for the information to be conveyed, but the voice tone was believed to achieve more and hence, to be crucial to stimulate certain feelings within pupils. Related to this, the closeness between human being’s souls and their voice was also presented in journals and manuals through the arguments of the centrality of the teacher's voice in class. In that way, Flament’s manual, as well as some journal articles, had defended the essential role of the teacher’s voice in comparison to written sources of instructions[[190]](#footnote-190). This could be linked to Le Breton’s claim that voice should be increasingly studied in a qualitative way as voice tone and other characteristics of the voice have a significant impact on the content of the speech[[191]](#footnote-191).

On top of those findings that are unique to this thesis, it is also important to highlight a point that is contradicting Calcoen’s explorative research. In his thesis, he had concluded that a significant number of articles he had investigated talked about the voice from a rather medical scope[[192]](#footnote-192). By this, he meant that some articles touched upon the health of the teacher’s vocal organs and described practices that were good or detrimental for their body. Despite some mentions of such concerns, the articles on which the present thesis is based on only found rare instances of such worries. Along those lines, among the benefits of not raising the voice, Braun wrote a sentence about the need for teachers to preserve their voice, but even this suggestion to keep a certain volume was presented more in terms of keeping order within the class[[193]](#footnote-193).

The previous paragraphs have discussed how the teacher’s voice was described in the investigated journals and manuals. The conclusion of these observations lead to think that some reflection was made regarding the teacher’s voice and ideas such as student’s attention or the teacher’s authority. Nonetheless, because this thesis is still rather exploratory, it is difficult to conclude firmly that such reflections were a major current in the pedagogical field of this time frame. This leads to answering the second part of the first research question regarding the problematization of the teacher’s voice. Because the investigated period is relatively short, it cannot be concluded that there is, or is not, a problematization of the teacher’s voice.

Based on this, the answer to the second question will not talk about problematization anymore but will compare the ways the teacher’s voice was presented in the investigated archives. It can be concluded that there is no difference in those presentations between liberal and Catholic educational ideologies. This could be explained by the fact that through their everyday practices, teachers in Catholic education were aware that pupils needed to understand the content of what was taught[[194]](#footnote-194). This countered the Catholic authority’s belief which emphasized more routine memorization, especially in terms of religious teaching[[195]](#footnote-195). Nonetheless, because teachers wanted to keep their professional competences and authority, they did not clash with the pedagogical practices more prominent in liberal educational journals[[196]](#footnote-196). The rather dogmatic idea of Catholic education that a teacher’s authority came from the absolute power of God was still reflected in Catholic journals. However, as Depaepe notes, the evolution towards a looser education that emphasized emotions could also be seen through references to the need of the teacher’s voice to talk to children’s souls[[197]](#footnote-197). Hence, despite some differences in deeper pedagogical beliefs, there was no significant difference regarding the description of the teacher’s voice between the two educational beliefs.

It is also important to point out that throughout the investigated period, there does not seem to be a shift in how the teacher’s voice was advised to be used. Indeed, articles in *Le Progrès* or *L’école Catholique* – which were published in the 1880’s – addressed the voice in similar ways to articles published in *L’Ecole belge* in the beginning of the 20th century. This was also the case in the investigated manuals. The fact that only a limited number of journals and manuals could be investigated, and that those were published in a time-span of 35 years, might be a reason for this. Nonetheless, it is noteworthy to compare some of the advice given to teachers from 1880 to 1914 and some of the vocal practices of teachers today, such as the ones presented in the study of Moustapha-Sabeur and Aguilar. Indeed, while the journals investigated for this thesis mentioned that varying the tone of voice and showing both firmness and affection to students was advised to teachers, the study of Moustapha-Sabeur and Aguilar has shown that some teachers use the same techniques in the 21st century[[198]](#footnote-198).

This observation leads to a last point to be concluded. In the investigated journals and manuals, explicit mentions of the teacher’s voice were relatively rare. As the fourth chapter of this thesis has shown, mentions of *the speech* were more numerous, and these focused more on the content than on the form (i.e. the voice). This could suggest that the teacher was more conceptualized in terms of his intellectual knowledge than in terms of his bodily practices in the classroom. This hypothesis could also be sustained by the relatively few mentions of other bodily practices in the investigated journals and manuals. In that way, the use of gestures and the use of the gaze were mentioned a few times in those archives, but they were never developed thoroughly. Despite the descriptions of the teacher’s voice in terms of a didactic and pedagogical tool, it could be suggested that the voice is so embodied that it tended to be rarely questioned. It was perhaps self-evident that the teacher needed to use its voice to transmit knowledge and to manage the classroom, hence not much attention was brought to it.

## 5.2. Limitations and further suggestions

Although the present thesis has extended the understanding of the teacher’s voice in a historical way, a number of important limitations need to be considered. This is especially important as the choice of pedagogical journals that were investigated was limited. Firstly, in terms of geographical constraints, the present thesis could only be based on journals and manuals that were available at the HCPPW and the Royal Library of Belgium. Although those two databases offer an extensive choice of journals and manuals that are kept in good condition, it should be noted that they do not preserve all the pedagogical journals listed in De Vroede’s index. For practical reasons, the journals that are kept in other Belgian university libraries could not be consulted. Another limitation related to the geographical constraints is related to the research question. The present thesis tried to investigate how teachers from the whole country were advised to use their voice in French-written journals, meaning that the journals chosen for the analysis were limited to those that could be the most relevant for teachers in the Flanders. This has eliminated French-written journals that were mainly addressing teachers from the Walloon part of the country.

Secondly, in terms of time frame, journals published after the First World War were not investigated. This is partly due to the research question of this thesis that aimed to look for differences between educational beliefs. This required investigation into Catholic pedagogical journals that were written in French and could have been read in Flanders too. As explained in the methodology section, only two of such journals could be identified. One of them was investigated (*L’école Catholique*), while the other (*L’éducateur belge*) could not be investigated as the numbers published between 1919 and 1940 were not preserved in any of the libraries. To compensate, manuals have been added, but to guarantee a balance between the liberal and Catholic source material, the time frame was limited to 1914.

Based on those limitations, several suggestions for further research can be made. Before enunciating them, it is important to stress the relevance to continue this exploratory work in order to have a deeper historical understanding of the teacher’s voice. This is especially the case since the present thesis has opened the doors for more thorough historical research in the teacher’s voice.

In order to continue a more thorough analysis of the presentation and potential problematization of the teacher’s voice throughout history, a first suggestion is to study pedagogical journals that were published in the same time frame as this thesis but that were targeting teachers from Brussels or Wallonia, such as *L’instituteur belge* (1904-191) or *L’enseignement pratique* (1890-1914). On a similar line, it could also be interesting to analyze pedagogical journals that were published from around the 1910’s onwards and that were specifically interested in pedagogy, and more specifically in the science of pedagogy that was called pedology. Such studies could include some journals such as *Les annales pedologiques* (1909-1914) or *Bulletin de l'association medico-pedagogique liégeoise* (1912-1934). Other journals published after the Second World War by teachers in Wallonia could also be interesting to study. Some of them were more focused on a specific pedagogy, such as *Adaptation* (1930-1936), published in Liège from a pedagogical laboratory focused on the Decroly pedagogy or *Cahiers pédagogiques* (1935-1961), also published in Liège and focused on experimental pedagogy. Finally, in terms of source material, it could also be interesting to focus more on teacher’s manuals. Those should be more focused on pedagogical practices than pedagogical journals and could bring more information about the teacher’s voice. Following these suggestions, research questions that could be addressed are: how was the teacher’s voice presented in pedagogical journals or manuals published in the inter-war period or in the second half of the 20th century? What could explain specific concerns around the teacher’s voice in those time frames? A special focus could be brought to medical or health concerns related to the teacher’s voice, as the contradicting finding between this thesis and Calcoen’s thesis needs to be investigated further. Those questions would notably allow for a deeper understanding of how the teacher’s voice was described and the different reflections made in different decades.

These questions could also help to dig further the research question that could not be answered in this thesis, namely the question of the problematization of the teacher’s voice. In that way, further studies could base themselves on the findings of this thesis and investigate whether there is a difference between the presentation of the teacher’s voice between 1880 and 1914 and the inter-war period, or the end of the 20th century. This means that further research could also investigate the presentation of the teacher's voice in a more longitudinal way to create a more comprehensive picture of the topic. This angle seems especially interesting as the archives at the basis of this thesis, although limited in numbers, seemed notably to link the teacher’s voice to a specific form of authority. This authority was depicted as something needed to have order in class, but it would be necessary to conduct more research and delve deeper into the link between the desired kinds of teacher’s authority and their voice. Studies on a longer time frame could therefore be interesting to compare different definitions of teacher’s authority and the link to the use of their voice. Questions that could guide those research are, for example, whether there is a shift in the link between those two concepts, and if so, what could cause the shift. Additionally, what does the link or the shift in the link say about how education was conceptualized? Longitudinal research could also attempt to explain when the teacher’s voice started to be problematized and in what terms? Such research could be valuable to build a scientifically stronger understanding of the micro contexts of classrooms. This would contribute to the field of history of education as Depape et al. suggest it:

“The question of how- through its educational agents - society has sought to convey its knowledge, values and skills to new generations in a variety of socio-historical contexts, ought to be a central one in a discipline concerned with the study of educational history”[[199]](#footnote-199)

Overall, more research should be conducted on this topic as this thesis seems to show that the teacher's voice is a very crucial part of the teaching practice that nonetheless seems to be neglected, probably because it is deeply embedded in the teacher’s body. It seems that scholars in history of education have not studied teacher’s bodily practices thoroughly yet, and hence this thesis induces a plea to expand further this field of research.

# Bibliography

## 6.1. Bibliography primary sources

### L’Ecole belge

L’Ecole belge. “Ressort de Namur.” 2*,* no*.* 24 (1910): 337-39

L’Ecole belge. “Préparation à l'examen d'inspecteur.” 4, no. 18 (1912): 238-39

L’Ecole belge. “Ressort de Dinant.” 5, no. 24 (1913): 200-202

L’Ecole belge. “Ressort de Dinant.” 5, no. 33 (1913): 307-10

L’Ecole belge. “Ressort du Limbourg.” 5, no. 27 (1913): 244-45

L’Ecole belge. . “Ressort du Limbourg.” 5, no. 28 (1913): 249-50

L’Ecole belge. “Ressort de Tournai.” 5, no*.* 23 (1913): 194-96.

Omer. “Travaux de conférence, Bruxelles.” *L'Ecole belge* 3, no.2 (1911): 17-19

Van Biervlielt. “L'attention.” *L’Ecole belge* 4, no.36 (1912): 529-30

### L’école Catholique

A.V.A. “De l'enseignement.” *L’école Catholique* 3, no. 20 (1884): 21-22.

A.V.A. “De l’enseignement considéré comme moyen d’éducation.” *L’école Catholique* 8, no.13 (1889): 273-74.

A.V.A. “L’éducateur.” *L’école Catholique* 9, no. 17 (1882): 357-59.

C.D. “V. Vertus qui donnent l’autorité.” *L’école Catholique,* 1, no. 17 (1882): 316-19.

C.D. “III. L’autorité est indispensable dans l’éducation.” *L’école Catholique 1, no.* 13 (1882): 237-40.

De la Salle. “Principes disciplinaires.” *L’école Catholique* 7*, no.* 9 (1888): 164-66.

L’école Catholique. “Qualité nécessaire d’un instituteur.” 1, no. 4 (1882): 57-58.

J.J.B. “Devoir de conférence : Méthode pour l’enseignement de l’histoire nationale dans l’école primaire.” *L’école Catholique* 6*,* no*.* 4 (1887): 64-70.

L’école Catholique, “Bibliographie.” 1, no. 1 (1880).

L’école Catholique. “La tâche de l’instituteur est une œuvre de patience. Quelle doit être la nature de cette patience ? Développement. Conclusion.” 11, no. 9 (1892): 182-86.

### Moniteur des instituteurs primaires

Auverdin, A. “De la discipline.” *Moniteur des instituteurs primaires* 9, no.4 (1880): 52-54.

A.G. “Formation du langage des enfants : moyens dont dispose l’instituteur.” 30*,* no. 18 (1901): 273-74.

Interim. “Qualités que doivent revêtir les questions pour éviter les erreurs de jugement.” *Moniteur des instituteurs primaires* 30, no. 6 (1901): 81-84.

Moniteur des instituteurs primaires. “Montrer qu’il faut former et diriger la volonté de l’enfant. Indiquer ce que doit faire l’école par son système disciplinaire et par son enseignement pour atteindre ce but.” 30, no. 48 (1901): 756-62.

Moniteur des instituteurs primaires. “Utilité de l’étude pour l’instituteur.” 31, no. 9 (1902): 129-30.

Moniteur des instituteurs primaires. “Apprenez à lire.” 31, no. 11 (1902): 169-70.

Moniteur des instituteurs primaires. “Méthodologie.” 31, no. 13 (1902): 193-99.

Moniteur des instituteurs primaires. “Pour bien lire.” 31, no. 13 (1902): 201-3.

### Le Progrès

Dubois, F.A. “Question de conférence (Brabant) : Dites ce que vous entendez par perception ; comment contribue-t-elle dans la formation des idées, et donnez les moyens propre à cultiver cette faculté.” *Le Progrès* 20, no. 5 (1880): 52-54.

E.J.P. (1882). “Cercle pédagogique de Quevaucamps. Réunion du 24 novembre 1881.” *Le Progrès* 22, no. 8 (1882): 60-62.

Guerlot, J. “De la lecture : Moyens d’en inspirer le gout.” *Le Progrès* 21, no. 6 (1881): 61-63

H.W. “Question de Conférence (Hainaut).” *Le Progrès* 20, no. 5 (1880), 50-52.

Lambert, G. “Quelques moyens propres à assurer une bonne discipline dans une école primaire.” *Le Progrès* 20, no. 9 (1880): 99-101.

Croisieaux, F.J. “De la discipline dans la division supérieure des écoles primaires.” *Le Progrès* 21, no. 26 (1881): 300-303.

Le Progrès. “De la discipline dans une école.” 22, no. 30 (1882): 233-34

Le Progrès. “Quels sont les moyens propres à établir et à maintenir une bonne discipline primaire ?.” 23, no. 8 (1883): 57-59.

Le Progrès. “Encore de l’intuition.” 20, no. 24 (1880): 279-80.

Omer, Antoine. “Comment l’instituteur doit préparer ses leçons.” *Le Progrès* 25, no. 28 (1885): 257-58.

Rassart, E. “L’enseignement de l’histoire nationale à l’école primaire.” *Le Progrès 22*, no. 1 (1882): 1-5.

Rassart, E. “L’enseignement de l’histoire nationale à l’école primaire (Suite).” *Le Progrès* 22, no. 2 (1882): 10-13.

S. “La discipline dans l’école.” *Le Progrès* 21, no. 27 (1881): 313-14.

Tollerne, C. “Disposition particulière de l’homme par rapport au corps et à l’âme.” *Le Progrès* 25, no. 41 (1885): 362-63.

### Manuals

Braun, Thomas. *Cours complet de pédagogie et de méthodologie*. Bruxelles : Librairie classique A-N. Lebègue et Cie, 1885.

Collard, François. *La pédagogie classique et la pédagogie expérimentale.* Louvain : Imprimerie et Librairie Charles Peeters, 1910.

Flament, A. *Quelques directions méthodologiques pour le personnel des écoles primaires et les maîtresses froebeliennes*. Liège : Dessain, 1905.

Pierenne, Jean Nicolas Joseph. *Résumé du cours de pédagogie*. Saint-Trond: Schouberechts-Van West, 1880.

V.A., Achille. (1882). *Traité théorique et pratique de méthodologie* (4th ed.). Namur : Wesmael-Charlier.

## 6.2. Bibliography secondary literature

Armstrong, Derrick. “Historical voices: philosophical idealism and the methodology of 'voice' in the history of education.” *History of Education* 32*,* no. 2 (2003): 201-17. 10.1080/00467600304157

Bele, Irene Velsvik. (2008). “The Teacher's Voice: Vocal training in teacher education.” *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research* 52, no. 1(2008): 41-57.

Burke, Catherine and Ian Grosvenor. “The Hearing School: an exploration of sound and listening in the modern school.” *Paedagogica Historica* 47, no. 3 (2011): 323-40.

Calcoen, Nick and Pieter Verstraete. “De stem van de meester: Een exploratief onderzoek naar de letterlijke stem van de onderwijzer tussen 1880 en 1940.” Master thesis, KU Leuven, 2022.

Corbin, Alain. *Les cloches de la terre : paysage sonore et culture sensible dans les campagnes au XIXe siècle*. Paris: Albin Michel, 1994.

Depaepe, Marc, Kristof Dams, Maurice De Vroede, Betty Eggermont, Hilde Lauwers, Frank Simon, Rolan Vandenberghe, and Jef Verhoeven. *Order in Progress : Everyday Education Practice in Primary Schools, Belgium, 1880-1970.* Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2000.

De Vroede, Maurits and An Bosmans-Hermans. Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 1, De periodieken 1817-1878. Leuven: KUL, 1973.

De Vroede, Maurits and An Bosmans-Hermans. Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 2, De periodieken 1878-1895. Leuven: KUL, 1974.

De Vroede, Maurits and An Bosmans-Hermans. Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 3, De periodieken 1896-1914. Leuven: KUL, 1976.

De Vroede, Maurits and An Bosmans-Hermans. Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 4, De periodieken 1914-1940. Leuven: KUL, 1987.

Direction générale de l’enseignement scolaire. *La voix de l’enseignant*. Paris: Ministère de l’Education national, 2007. https://kerstinteixido.typepad.fr/voix-enseignant.pdf

Fendler, Lynn. “New Cultural Histories.” In *Handbook of Historical Studies in Education*, edited by Tanya Fitzgerald, 1-17. Singapore: Springer Singapore, 2019.

Gressler, Jean. “F. Collard (1852-1927).” *Revue belge de Philologie et d’Histoire* 7, no.1 (1928): 390-91.

Hoegaerts, Josephine. “Silence as borderland: a semiotic approach to the “silent” pupil in nineteenth-century vocal education.” *Paedagogica Historica* 53*, no.* 5 (2017): 514-27.

Koch, Anette Boye. “Sounds of Education: Teacher Role and Use of Voice in Interactions with Young Children.” *International Journal of Early Childhood* 49, no. 1 (2017): 57-72. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13158-017-0184-6>.

Landahl, Joakim. “Learning to listen and look: the shift from the monitorial system of education to teacher-led lessons.” *The Senses and Society* 14, no. 2 (2019): 194-206. https://doi-org.kuleuven.e-bronnen.be/10.1080/17458927.2019.1619314.

Le Breton, David. *Eclats de voix : une anthropologie des voix*. Paris: Editions Métailié, 2011.

Martins, Regina Helena Garcia, Eny Regina Bóia Neves Pereira, Caio Bosque Hidalgo, and Elaine Lara Mendes Tavares. “Voice Disorders in Teachers. A Review.” *Journal of Voice* 28, no. 6 (2014): 716–24. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvoice.2014.02.008.

Minten, Luc, Marc Depaepe and Maurits De Vroede. *Les statistiques de l’enseignement en Belgique. 3 : L’enseignement primaire 1979-1929.* Bruxelles: Archives Générales Du Royaume, 1993.

Moustapha-Sabeur, Malak and Jose Ignacio Aguilar Río. “Faire corps avec sa voix : paroles d’enseignant.” In *Le corps et la voix de l’enseignant : théorie et pratique,* edited by Marion Tellier and Lucile Cadet, 67-79. Paris: Maison des Langues, 2014.

Rosenberg, Gail Gregg, Patricia Blake-Rather, Judy Heavner, Linda Allen, Beatrice Myers Redmond, Janet Phillips, and Kathy Stigers. “Improving Classroom Acoustics (ICA): A Three-Year FM Sound Field Classroom Amplification Study.” *Journal of Educational Audiology*, no. 7 (1999): 8-28.

Schafer, Murray. *The New Soundscape: A handbook for the Modern Music Teacher.* Ontario: Berandol Music Limited, 1969.

St. Pierre, Joshua and Charis St Pierre. “Governing the Voice: A Critical History of Speech-Language Pathology.” *Foucault Studies,* no. 24 (2018): 151-84. 10.22439/fs.v0i24.5530.

Verstraete, Pieter. “Silence or the sound of limpid water: disability, power, and the educationalisation of silence.” *Paedagogica Historica,* 53, no. 5 (2017): 498-513.

Witte, Els. “La question linguistique en Belgique dans une perspective historique.” *Pouvoirs* 1, no. 136 (2011): 37-50.

1. “Mieux connaître, utiliser et préserver sa voix,”La Ligue, accessed May 2, 2023, <https://ligue-enseignement.be/formations/mieux-connaitre-utiliser-et-preserver-sa-voix> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. “apprivoiser”, ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. “Last van je stem ? Probeer deze tips van stemcoach Aagje Dom,” Klasse, updated September 15, 2020, <https://www.klasse.be/238795/last-van-je-stem-probeer-deze-tips-van-stemcoach-aagje-dom/> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Marc Depaepe et al., *Order in Progress Everyday Education Practice in Primary Schools – Belgium 1880-1970*. (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2000), 23. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Murray Schafer, *The New Soundscape : A handbook for the Modern Music Teacher*. (Ontario :Berandol Music Limited, 1969). [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Ibidem [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Alain Corbin, *Les cloches de la terre : paysage sonore et culture sensible dans les campagnes au XIXe siècle*. (Paris: Albin Michel, 1994). [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Depaepe et al., *Order in Progress,*9; Derrick Armstrong, “Historical Voices: Philosophical Idealism and the Methodology of ‘voice’ in the History of Education,” *History of Education* 32, no. 2 (2003): 202, https://doi.org/10.1080/00467600304157. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. Depaepe et al., *Order in Progress*. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Pieter Verstraete, “Silence or the Sound of Limpid Water: Disability, Power, and the Educationalisation of Silence,” *Paedagogica Historica* 53, no. 5 (2017): 502, https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2017.1296475. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Catherine Burke and Ian Grosvenor, “The Hearing School: An Exploration of Sound and Listening in the Modern School,” *Paedagogica Historica* 47, no. 3 (2011): 328–30, https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2010.530273. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Joakim Landahl, “Learning to Listen and Look: The Shift from the Monitorial System of Education to Teacher-Led Lessons,” *The Senses & Society* 14, no. 2 (2019): 196-198, https://doi.org/10.1080/17458927.2019.1619314. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Josephine Hoegaerts, “Silence as Borderland: A Semiotic Approach to the ‘Silent’ Pupil in Nineteenth-Century Vocal Education,” *Paedagogica Historica* 53, no. 5 (2017): 526–27, https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2017.1340316. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. See for example David Le Breton, *Eclats de voix : une anthropologie des voix* (Paris: Editions Métaillié, 2011).  [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Schafer, *The New Soundscape.* [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. Le Breton, *Eclats de voix.* [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. Irene Velsvik Bele, “The Teacher’s Voice: Vocal Training in Teacher Education,” *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research* 52, no. 1 (2008): 41–57, https://doi.org/10.1080/00313830701786594. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. Regina Helena Garcia Martins et al., “Voice Disorders in Teachers. A Review,” *Journal of Voice* 28, no. 6 (2014): 716–24, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvoice.2014.02.008. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. Bele, “The Teacher’s Voice”, 42. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. Gail Gregg Rosenberg et al., “Improving Classroom Acoustics (ICA): A Three-Year FM Sound Field Classroom Amplification Study,” *Journal of Educational Audiology,* no. 7 (1999), 8-28. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Direction générale de l’enseignement scolaire, *La voix de l’enseignant* (Paris: Ministère de l’Education national, 2007), <https://kerstinteixido.typepad.fr/voix-enseignant.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. Bele, “The Teacher’s Voice: Vocal Training in Teacher Education,” 43. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. Armstrong, “Historical Voices”. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. See for example Hoegaerts, “Silence as borderline”; Verstraete, “Silence or the sound”. [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. Vertstraete, “Silence or the sound”. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. Le Breton, *Eclats de voix.* [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Ibidem*.* [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Hoegaerts, “Silence as borderline,” 526-27. [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. Bele, “The Teacher’s Voice,” 44. [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. Le Breton, *Eclats de voix*; Bele, “The Teacher’s Voice,” 44-45. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. Joshua St Pierre and Charis St Pierre, “Governing the Voice: A Critical History of Speech-Language Pathology,” *Foucault Studies*, no. 24 (2018): 151–84, https://doi.org/10.22439/fs.v0i24.5530. [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Le Breton, *Eclats de voix*. [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. Verstraete, “Sound and silence,” 506-11. [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. Landahl, “Learning to listen,” 198. [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. Depape et al., *Order in Progress*, 77. [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. Anette Boye Koch, “Sounds of Education: Teacher Role and Use of Voice in Interactions with Young Children,” *International Journal of Early Childhood* 49, no. 1 (2017): 57–72, https://doi.org/10.1007/s13158-017-0184-6. [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. Ibidem, 71. [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. Direction générale de l’enseignement scolaire, *La voix de l’enseignant.* [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. Ibidem, 1. [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. Malek Moustapha-Sabeur and Jose Ignacio Aguilar Río, ”Faire corps avec sa voix : paroles d’enseignant,” in *Le corps et la voix de l’enseignant : théorie et pratique*, ed.Marion Tellier and Lucile Cadet (Paris: Maison des Langues, 2014), 67-79. [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. « La voix se matérialise en fonction de principes et d'une expérience qui évoluent selon le parcours de l'enseignant. Voix et identité enseignante sont liées : c'est en travaillant sa voix – en y réfléchissant – que l’enseignant comprend, construit et modifie sa manière d’être enseignant. », ibidem, 9. [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. Lynn Fendler, “New Cultural Histories,” in *Handbook of Hisotircal Studies in Education*, ed. Tanya Fitzgerald (Singapore: Springer Singapore, 2019), 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
58. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-58)
59. Depaepe et al., *Order in Progress.* [↑](#footnote-ref-59)
60. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-60)
61. Fendler, “New Cultural Histories”. [↑](#footnote-ref-61)
62. Nick Calcoen & Pieter Verstraete, “De stem van de meester: Een exploratief onderzoek naar de letterlijke stem van de onderwijzer tussen 1880 en 1940” (master’s thesis*,* KU Leuven, 2022), https://repository.teneo.libis.be/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\_pid=IE17050704&. [↑](#footnote-ref-62)
63. Depape et al., *Order in Progress*, 56. [↑](#footnote-ref-63)
64. Luc Minten, Marc Depaepe, and Maurits De Vroede, *Les statistiques de l’enseignement en Belgique. 3 : L’enseignement primaire 1979-1929* (Bruxelles: Archives Générales Du Royaume, 1993), 48. [↑](#footnote-ref-64)
65. Ibidem, 37. [↑](#footnote-ref-65)
66. Ibidem, 56. [↑](#footnote-ref-66)
67. Els Witte, “La question linguistique en Belgique dans une pesrpective historique,” *Pouvoirs* 1, no. 136 (2011): 37-50. [↑](#footnote-ref-67)
68. Depaepe et al., *Order in Progress,* 19-22. [↑](#footnote-ref-68)
69. Ibidem, 56. [↑](#footnote-ref-69)
70. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-70)
71. Maurits De Vroede and An Bosmans Hermans, Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 2, De periodieken 1878-1895 (Leuven : KUL, 1974), 54-56. [↑](#footnote-ref-71)
72. Maurits De Vroede and An Bosmans Hermans, Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 1, De periodieken 1817-1878 (Leuven : KUL, 1973); Maurits De Vroede and An Bosmans Hermans, De periodieken 1878-1895; Maurits De Vroede and and An Bosmans Hermans, Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 3, De periodieken 1896-1914 (Leuven : KUL, 1976); Maurits De Vroede and and An Bosmans Hermans, Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het pedagogisch leven in België in de 19de en 20ste eeuw: Deel 4, De periodieken 1914-1945 (Leuven : KUL, 1987). [↑](#footnote-ref-72)
73. Calcoen and Verstraete, “De stem van de meester,” 17. [↑](#footnote-ref-73)
74. Calcoen and Verstraete, “De stem van de meester”. [↑](#footnote-ref-74)
75. De Vroede and Bosmans Hermans, De periodieken 1817-1878, 295. [↑](#footnote-ref-75)
76. Ibidem, 296. [↑](#footnote-ref-76)
77. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-77)
78. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-78)
79. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-79)
80. Ibidem, 475. [↑](#footnote-ref-80)
81. Ibidem*.* [↑](#footnote-ref-81)
82. Ibidem, 476. [↑](#footnote-ref-82)
83. Ibidem*.* [↑](#footnote-ref-83)
84. De Vroede and Bosmans Hermans, De periodieken 1896-1914, 1276. [↑](#footnote-ref-84)
85. De Vroede and Bosmans Hermans, De periodieken 1878-1895, 203. [↑](#footnote-ref-85)
86. Ibidem, 202. [↑](#footnote-ref-86)
87. L’Ecole Catholique, “Bibliographie,” 1, no. 1 (1880). [↑](#footnote-ref-87)
88. François Collard, *La pédagogie classique et la pédagogie expérimentale* (Louvain : Imprimerie et Librairie Charles Peeters, 1910). [↑](#footnote-ref-88)
89. Jean Gressler, “F. Collard (1852-1927),” *Revue belge de Philologie et d’Histoire* 7, no.1 (1928): 390-91. [↑](#footnote-ref-89)
90. Collard, *La pédagogie classique*. [↑](#footnote-ref-90)
91. De Vroede and Bosmans Hermans, De periodieken 1817-1878, 212. [↑](#footnote-ref-91)
92. A.V.A., “L’éducateur,” *L’école Catholique* 9, no. 17 (1890): 357; L’Ecole belge, “Préparation à l’examen d’inspecteur,” 4, no. 18 (1912): 238; L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Tournai,” 5, no. 23 (1913): 194. [↑](#footnote-ref-92)
93. « Un maître d’école qui enseigne ou morigène les écoliers d’une voix uniformément tonitruante ne se fera pas écouter. Mais, s’il sait passer au moyen de graduation nuancée, de ton énergique au grave et au doux, il sera sûr d’éveiller une attention soutenue. », L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Tournai,” 194. [↑](#footnote-ref-93)
94. L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Tournai,” 194; L’école Catholique, “Qualité nécessaire d’un instituteur,” 1, no. 4 (1882): 57; Omer, “Travaux de conférence, Bruxelles,” *L’Ecole belge* 3, no*.* 2 (1911): 17. [↑](#footnote-ref-94)
95. Achille V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique de méthodologie,* 4th ed. (Namur: Wesmael-Charlier, 1882), 45-58; Jean Nicholas Joseph Pirenne*, Enseignement normal primaire: Résumé du cours de pédagogie; par un ancien directeur d’école normale* (Saint-Trond: Schouberechts-Van West, 1880), 60-63; L’Ecole belge, “Préparation à l’examen,” 238. [↑](#footnote-ref-95)
96. Pirenne, *Résumé du cours de pédagogie*, 28. [↑](#footnote-ref-96)
97. E. Rassart, “L’enseignement de l’histoire nationale à l’école primaire (Suite),” *Le Progrès* 22, no. 2 (1882): 11; V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique*, 63. [↑](#footnote-ref-97)
98. « agréable, étendue, souple et sonore », L’école Catholique, “Qualité nécessaire,” 57; « claire », C.D., “V. Vertus qui donnent l’autorité,” *L’école Catholique* 2, no. 17 (1882): 316. [↑](#footnote-ref-98)
99. « Si le ton de la voix ne doit pas être déclamatoire, il ne peut non plus être monotone, mais expressif et varié » V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique*, 39. [↑](#footnote-ref-99)
100. Ibidem, 54. [↑](#footnote-ref-100)
101. Interim, “Qualités que doivent revêtir les questions pour éviter les erreurs de jugement,” *Moniteur des instituteurs primaires* 30, no. 6 (1901): 82. [↑](#footnote-ref-101)
102. V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique,* 63*.* [↑](#footnote-ref-102)
103. L’Ecole Belge, “Préparation à l’examen,” 238. [↑](#footnote-ref-103)
104. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-104)
105. Pierenne, *Résumé du cours de pédagogie*, 66; V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique,* 54. [↑](#footnote-ref-105)
106. L’Ecole belge, “Préparation à l’examen,” 238-239; Thomas Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie et de méthodologie* (Bruxelles: Librairie classique A-N. Lebègue & Cie, 1885), 36. [↑](#footnote-ref-106)
107. E. Rassart, L’enseignement de l’histoire nationale à l’école primaire,” *Le Progrès* 22, no. 1 (1882): 2; J.J.B., “Méthode pour l’enseignement de l’histoire nationale dans l’école primaire,” 6, no. 4 (1887), 65. [↑](#footnote-ref-107)
108. L’Ecole belge, “Préparation à l’examen,” 238-239. [↑](#footnote-ref-108)
109. E. Rassart, “L’enseignement de l’histoire,” 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-109)
110. L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Namur,” 2*,* no*.* 24 (1910), 338. [↑](#footnote-ref-110)
111. L’Ecole belge, “Préparation à l’examen,” 238. [↑](#footnote-ref-111)
112. J. Guerlot, “De la lecture : Moyens d’en inspirer le gout,” *Le Progrès*20, no. 6 (1880), 62. [↑](#footnote-ref-112)
113. J. Guerlot, “De la lecture,” 62; Moniteur des instituteurs primaires, “Pour bien lire,” 31, no. 13 (1902): 202-3. [↑](#footnote-ref-113)
114. Omer, “Travaux de conférence, Bruxelles,” 18. [↑](#footnote-ref-114)
115. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 34-35. [↑](#footnote-ref-115)
116. « Il faut produire ce qui attire l’attention: intensité et variation d’intensité, soudaineté, » Van Biervielt, “L’attention,” *L’Ecole belge* 4, no. 36 (1913): 513. [↑](#footnote-ref-116)
117. Achille V.A., “De l’enseignement,” *L’école Catholique* 3, no. 20 (1884): 21; Achille V.A., “De l’enseignement considéré comme moyen d’éducation,” *L’école Catholique* 8, no. 13 (1889): 273; F.A. Dubois, “Question de conférence (Brabant): Dites ce que vous entendez par perception; comment contribue-t-elle dans la formation des idées, et donnez les moyens propre à cultiver cette faculté,” *Le Progrès* 20, no. 5 (1880): 53; J.J.B., “Devoir de conférence : Méthode pour l’enseignement de l’histoire nationale dans l’école primaire,” 6, no. 4 (1887): 65. [↑](#footnote-ref-117)
118. Van Biervliet, “L’attention,” 530. [↑](#footnote-ref-118)
119. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*,34; G. Lambert, “Quelques moyens propres à assurer une bonne discipline dans une école primaire,” *Le Progrès* 29, no*.* 9 (1880): 100. [↑](#footnote-ref-119)
120. A. Auverdin, “De la dicipline,” *Moniteur des instituteurs primaires* 9, no. 4 (1880): 52*.* [↑](#footnote-ref-120)
121. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-121)
122. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie,* 34-36; Dubois, “Question de conférence (Brabant),”53; L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Dinant.” 5, no. 33 (1913): 307-10; L’école Catholique, “Méthode pour l’enseignement de l’histoire nationale dans l’école primaire,”7, no. 4 (1887): 65. [↑](#footnote-ref-122)
123. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 29. [↑](#footnote-ref-123)
124. « Si nous ignorions que l’homme est créé pour vivre dans une société intelligente et éclairée, le don seul de la parole nous l’apprendrait. », C. Tollerne, “Disposition particulière de l’homme par rapport au corps et à l’âme,” *Le Progrès* 25, no. 41 (1885): 363. [↑](#footnote-ref-124)
125. In French, those are words such as *langage*, *parole* or *débit*  [↑](#footnote-ref-125)
126. « C'est une grave illusion de croire que l'instituteur qui crie le plus longtemps et le plus fort obtiennent les meilleurs résultats. Le grand secret c'est de savoir trouver les paroles et le ton de voix les plus propres à éclairer l'esprit de l'élève et à toucher son cœur. », Braun, Cours complet de pédagogie, 29. [↑](#footnote-ref-126)
127. C.D., “III. L’autorité est indispensable dans l’éducation*,*” *L’école Catholique 1, no.* 17 (1882): 238. [↑](#footnote-ref-127)
128. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-128)
129. « une puissance légitime », ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-129)
130. J. De la Salle, “Principes disciplinaires,” *L’école Catholique* 8, no.9 (1888): 166. [↑](#footnote-ref-130)
131. Le Progrès, “Quels sont les moyens propres à établir et à maintenir une bonne discipline primaire ?,” 23, no. 8 (1883): 58-59. [↑](#footnote-ref-131)
132. Auverdin, “De la discipline,” 53. [↑](#footnote-ref-132)
133. De la Salle, “Principes disciplinaires,” 165. [↑](#footnote-ref-133)
134. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-134)
135. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 218; V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique,* 63. [↑](#footnote-ref-135)
136. L’école Catholique, “La tâche de l’instituteur est un œuvre de patience. Quelle doit être la nature de cette patience ? Développement. Conclusion,” 11, no. 9 (1892): 184; Moniteur des instituteurs primaires, “Montrer qu’il faut former et diriger la volonté de l’enfant. Indiquer ce que doit faire l’école par son système disciplinaire et par son enseignement pour atteindre ce but,” 30, no. 48 (1901): 758. [↑](#footnote-ref-136)
137. S., “La discipline dans l’école,” *Le Progrès* 21, no*.* 27(1881):313. [↑](#footnote-ref-137)
138. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 206  [↑](#footnote-ref-138)
139. « doucereuse indulgence », Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie, 206.* [↑](#footnote-ref-139)
140. « Chaleur », Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 200. [↑](#footnote-ref-140)
141. Antoine Omer, “Comment l’instituteur doit préparer ses leçons,” *Le Progrès* 25, no*.* 28 (1885): 257; Le Progrès, “Quels sont les moyens,” 58; V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique*, 54. [↑](#footnote-ref-141)
142. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 206. [↑](#footnote-ref-142)
143. Ibidem, 200. [↑](#footnote-ref-143)
144. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-144)
145. Moniteur des instituteurs primaires, “Méthodologie,” 31, no. 13 (1902): 196; Van Biervielt, “L’attention,” 529-530. [↑](#footnote-ref-145)
146. « Le talent de la parole, indispensable à qui veut enseigner, ne peut être que le fruit de beaucoup d'exercices préparatoires et d'une habitude contractée longtemps à l'avance », V.A., “De l’enseignement,” 274. [↑](#footnote-ref-146)
147. L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Limbourg,” 5, no.28 (1913): 245. [↑](#footnote-ref-147)
148. « le maître a pour devoir de cultiver chez lui l’art de la parole », ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-148)
149. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 223; Pierenne, *Résumé du cours de pédagogie,* 107. [↑](#footnote-ref-149)
150. Omer, “Comment l’instituteur doit préparer,” 258; S., “La discipline dans l’école,” Le Progrès 21, no.6 (1881): 313-14; Pirenne, *Résumé du cours de pédagogie*, 60; V.A., “De l’enseignement ,” 273-74. [↑](#footnote-ref-150)
151. Moniteur des instituteurs primaires, “Utilité de l’étude pour l’instituteur,” 31, no. 9 (1902): 129-30. [↑](#footnote-ref-151)
152. L’Ecole belge, “Ressort du Limbourg,” 249-50; Moniteur des instituteurs primaires, “Apprenez à lire,” 31, no. 11 (1902): 169-70. [↑](#footnote-ref-152)
153. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie, 23.* [↑](#footnote-ref-153)
154. Omer, “Comment l’instituteur doit préparer,” 258. [↑](#footnote-ref-154)
155. Dubois, “Question de conférence (Brabant),” 53. [↑](#footnote-ref-155)
156. « Car enfin la communication de l’âme ne s’opère que par l’intermédiaire du corps, des signes sensibles ; plus donc cet instrument sera parfait plus forte et plus parfaite sera son action », C.D., “V. Vertus,” 317. [↑](#footnote-ref-156)
157. Tollerne, “Disposition particulière de l’homme,” 363. [↑](#footnote-ref-157)
158. « (…) fermeté, patience, douceur, constance, impartibilité, silence, adresse, vigilance, zèle, prévoyance, générosité », C.D., “V. Vertus,” 318. [↑](#footnote-ref-158)
159. « La parole du maître est vivante, par son animation et son expression, elle parle à l’imagination, à l’esprit, au coeur de l’enfant (…) », L’Ecole belge, “Ressort du Limbourg,” 5, no. 27 (1913): 244-45. [↑](#footnote-ref-159)
160. Dubois, “Question de conférence (Brabant),” 54. [↑](#footnote-ref-160)
161. Le Progrès, “Encore de l’intuition,” 20, no. 24 (1880): 279. [↑](#footnote-ref-161)
162. V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-162)
163. « Celle-ci vit, résonne, se meut – celui-là sommeille, il est muet pour beaucoup et inanimé : elle force l’attention collective – il vous laisse à vous-même; Elle nuance les points saillants, -- il a un ton uniforme qui ne distingue pas l’essence, du détail ni le contingent, du nécessaire; Elle éclaire les obscurités dans les connaissance et s’y arrête pour les dissiper dans la lumière; il affirme, et passe outre », A. Flament, *Quelques directions méthodologiques pour le personnel des écoles primaires et les maitresses Frœbéliennes.* (Liège : Dessain, 1905), 162. [↑](#footnote-ref-163)
164. See for example Dubois, “Question de conférence (Brabant),” 52; V.A., “De l’enseignement,” 21. [↑](#footnote-ref-164)
165. Flament, *Quelques directions pour le personnel*, 160-163. [↑](#footnote-ref-165)
166. L’Ecole belge, “Ressort du Limbourg,” 244-45. [↑](#footnote-ref-166)
167. «froide », ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-167)
168. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-168)
169. « Le langage est l’âme de l’enseignement, il est central (…) La langue est donc, de loin, le premier moyen d’enseignement. », L’Ecole belge, “Ressort du Limbourg,” 244. [↑](#footnote-ref-169)
170. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-170)
171. V.A., “De l’enseignement,” 21. [↑](#footnote-ref-171)
172. A.G. (1901). “Formation du langage des enfants,” *Le Progrès* 30, *no.* 18 (1901): 273-274; V.A., “De l’enseignement,” 21; V.A., *Traité théorique et pratique*. [↑](#footnote-ref-172)
173. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 218-225. [↑](#footnote-ref-173)
174. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-174)
175. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-175)
176. A.G., “Formation du langage des enfants,” 273. [↑](#footnote-ref-176)
177. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie,* 224. [↑](#footnote-ref-177)
178. A.G., “Formation du langage des enfants,” 273; Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 224. [↑](#footnote-ref-178)
179. Le Progrès, “Quels sont les moyens propres à établir et à maintenir une bonne discipline primaire ?,” 23, no.8 (1883): 58. [↑](#footnote-ref-179)
180. A.G., “Formation du langage des enfants,” 273; Le Progrès, “Quels sont les moyens”, 58. [↑](#footnote-ref-180)
181. « une intonation mâle ferme, non chantante », A.G., “Formation du langage des enfant,” 273. [↑](#footnote-ref-181)
182. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie*, 35; V.A., “De l’enseignement,” 273. [↑](#footnote-ref-182)
183. « Dans les leçons, la parole du maître ne doit pas être l’essentiel, la substance de la leçon ; elle ne doit être qu’un accompagnement, un guide, une aide », L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Dinant,” 201. [↑](#footnote-ref-183)
184. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-184)
185. F.J. Croisieaux, “De la discipline dans la division supérieure des écoles primaires,” *Le Progrès* 21, no. 26 (1881): 300-303; E.J.P., “Cercle pédagogique de Quevaucamps : Réunion du 24 novembre 1881,” *Le Progrès* 22, no. 8 (1882): 61; H.W., “Question de Conférence (Hainaut),” *Le Progrès* 20, no. 5 (1880): 51; Moniteur des instituteurs primaires, “Méthodologie,” 194; L’Ecole belge, “Ressort de Dinant,” 201; Le Progrès, “Quels sont les moyens”, 59. [↑](#footnote-ref-185)
186. Calcoen and Verstraete, “De stem van de meester”, 68. [↑](#footnote-ref-186)
187. Landahl, “Learning to listen”. [↑](#footnote-ref-187)
188. Calcoen and verstraete, “De stem van de meester”, 37. [↑](#footnote-ref-188)
189. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-189)
190. Flament, *Quelques directions pour le personnel*, 162; L’Ecole belge, “Ressort du Limbourg,” 244-255; Le Progrès, Rassart, “L’enseignement de l’histoire,” 4. [↑](#footnote-ref-190)
191. Le Breton, *Eclats de voix*. [↑](#footnote-ref-191)
192. Calcoen and Verstraete, “De stem van de meester”, 40-41. [↑](#footnote-ref-192)
193. Braun, *Cours complet de pédagogie.* [↑](#footnote-ref-193)
194. Depape et al., *Order in Progress*, 24. [↑](#footnote-ref-194)
195. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-195)
196. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-196)
197. Ibidem. [↑](#footnote-ref-197)
198. Moustapha-Sabeur & Aguilar Río, “Faire corps avec sa voix”. [↑](#footnote-ref-198)
199. Depaepe et al., *Order in Progress*, 9. [↑](#footnote-ref-199)